

Notes

ON

CHURCH'S

TRIAL & DEATH OF SOCRATES.

BY

N. K. RAY, B.A., F.R.S.L., (Lond.),

Professor of English Literature, Meerut College; sometime senior
Professor of English Literature and History, Maharaja's College,
Jaipur; Author of Notes on Wilson's English Essays etc.,

THIRD EDITION

AGRA

Lackhmi Narayan Agarwal

Bookseller & Stationer,

[All Rights Reserved]

[Price Rs. 1-8-0]

ON
CHURCH'S
TRIAL & DEATH OF SOCRATES.

BY
N. K. RAY, B.A., F.R.S.L., (Lond.),
Professor of English Literature, Meerut College; sometime senior
Professor of English Literature and History, Maharaja's College,
Jaipur; Author of Notes on Wilson's English Essays etc.,

THIRD EDITION.

AGRA
Lackhmi Narayan Agarwala

Bookseller & Stationer,

All Rights Reserved)

(Price Rs. 1-8-0

THIRD EDITION OF NOTES
ON
CHURCH'S TRIAL AND DEATH OF SOCRATES
(Originally Published in 1895)

BY
Professor N. K. RAY, B.A., F.R.S.L. (London)
Exhaustive notes, summaries and model questions with answers or hints

To be had of the Publisher, LACKHMI NARAYAN
AGARWALA,
BOOKSELLER AND PUBLISHER,
SUBZI MANDI,
AGRA.

SOME SELECT OPINIONS:

THE HON'BLE MR. C. F. DE LA FOSSE, M. A., DIRECTOR
OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION, U. P., then Professor of English
Literature, Queen's College, Benares, says:—

"The book seems well adapted for the purpose for which it was
written, and should be of use to students in preparing for an examina-
tion. Much time and trouble seems to have been expended to make the
NOTES AS COMPLETE AS POSSIBLE."

The N. W. P. AND OUDH EDUCATIONAL MAGAZINE (Novr.
1896) says:—

"The notes are remarkably free from that besetting vice of the
Bengal School of Annotations...an over-copiousness which renders the
use of the Dictionary superfluous—and are at the same time FULL, and if
we may say so, UNUSUALLY ACCURATE. THE SYNOPSIS OF THE SOCRATIC
DOCTRINES (as Plato represents them) SHOWS FIRM GRASP AND
CLEAR INSIGHT. The Appendix containing model questions with answers
is sure to considerably enhance the value of the Notes in the eyes of all,
those who have to make use of them. If annotations must be used
such annotations may safely be used by our Intermediate students, who
have, we believe, got Church's excellent English version of Plato's Euthyphron,
Apology, Crito and Phædo in their English Course.

THE MOSLEM CHRONICLE (February 1896) says:—

"We have gone through some portions of it, and it appears to us that the other has spared no pains to make the *Notes* THOROUGHLY USEFUL to those for whom it is intended. There is an Appendix to the book containing model questions with answers, or hints to answers, which greatly enhances the utility of such annotated text-books. On the whole it is a nice little key to the *Trial and Death of Socrates*, and does CREDIT TO THE LEARNED AUTHOR.

Mr. RAMANAND CHATTERJEE, M.A., Editor, Modern Review, and late Principal, Kayasth Pathshala, Allahabad says:—

Mr. N. K. Ray, B.A.'s *Notes on Church's Trial and Death of Socrates* are EXCELLENT, BOTH IN POINT OF ACCURACY AND FULLNESS. They leave nothing to be desired.

THE REV. DR. J. HECTOR, M.A., D.D., late Principal, Duff College Calcutta, and Fellow and Examiner, Calcutta University, said:—

Professor N. K. Ray B.A.'s, *Notes on Church's Trial and Death of Socrates* will be found VERY HELPFUL to Indian students in enabling them to understand and appreciate the work it expounds.

THE LATE PRINCIPAL W. B. LIVINGSTONE of Rajshahi Govt. College, Bengal, said:—

I beg to thank you most heartily for your kindness in making me a present of your *NOTES ON CHURCH'S TRIAL AND DEATH OF SOCRATES*. It appears to me to be EXCEEDINGLY WELL DONE and to be A SPLENDID HELP TO BOTH STUDENTS AND PROFESSORS. I trust it will meet with an extensive sale. You are a credit to my teaching. Apologizing for the terrible delay in replying to your letter, and with best wishes for your welfare in time and eternity,"

I remain, yours very sincerely,

(Sd) W. B. LIVINGSTONE.

THE ADVOCATE, Lucknow (May, 1903):—

"The college (Mabaraja's College, Jaipur) possesses on its staff another veteran educationist, Mr. N. K. Ray, Senior Professor of English Literature, also well-known as author of a Commentary on *Church's Trial and Death of Socrates* and other works."

THE HINDUSTHAN REVIEW AND KAYASTH SAMACHAR, Allahabad (June, 1903):—

"Mr. N. K. Ray is well-known through his commentary on *Church's Trial and Death of Socrates* and other works,"

"I have read a great deal of Mr. N. K. Ray's *Notes on Church's Trial and Death of Socrates*, and have been admirably struck with it."

correct style, accuracy of expression, and clear and concise exposition of the meanings of passages. The compiler seems to have spared no pains to make the book profitable to those for whom it is intended. It rises above the mere crib to a kind of commentary, and will be specially useful to those who have no access to good books of reference."

(Sd.) ATA VEHARI BHADRI, M.A.,

CALCUTTA :

PROFESSOR ENGLISH LITERATURE.

May 26th, 1896.

Calcutta Boy's School, College Dept.

"I have gone very carefully through Professor N. K. Ray's *Notes on Church's Trial and Death of Socrates* (in two parts) and have found the *Notes* useful, scholarly and always to the point; they will not overburden the memory of the student, and will at the same time give him a clear and intelligent idea of the thoughts of the text. The synopsis of the Sanskrit Philosophy. This is a principle of work that has my fullest sympathy; and I should much like to see the principle adopted and worked upon by such of our countrymen as take to the work of compiling *Notes*. The Summary (in 44 pages) will prove, I doubt not, an invaluable aid to students reading for University Examinations."

CALCUTTA :

(Sd) LALIT KUMAR BANERJEE, M.A.,

April 21st, 1896.

Professor of English Literature, Ripon College.

Calcutta

"I have gone through Professor N. K. Ray's *Notes on Church's Trial and Death of Socrates*, and have much pleasure in stating that the work appears to me to evince a conscious care and thoroughness and a high standard of finish which are often wanting in books of its class, and which will make it truly instructive and useful to those for whom it is intended."

(Sd.) BRAJENDRA NATH SEAL, M.A., [Since, Ph. D.],

August 29th, 1895.

Principal, Berhampur College.

[King George V. Professor of Philosophy University of Calcutta].

"* * * I have * * * looked into your "*Notes*" with some care, and think they are calculated to be of the greatest help to those for whom they are intended. The student will find herein all the information he wants, collected from some of the best sources, with suggestive references and extracts here and there to impart an additional interest to the subject. Adapted to the capacities of all degrees of intelligence, I hope your little book will be found useful in imparting interest to the study of a work dealing with the most interesting figure in ancient Greece."

Yours sincerely,

(Sd.) BINOYENDRA NATH SEN [M. A.],

23, BHOWANI CHARAN DUTT'S
LANE, CALCUTTA:

May 3rd, 1896.

[Professor, Presidency College Calcutta
and University Inspector of Colleges,
Calcutta University].

" * * * I have found it to be a very good book of its kind. A book of this kind should show a happy mixture of thoroughness and suggestiveness, and I am glad to find in the book before me an illustration of this principle. I must congratulate Professor N. K. Ray on the choice of his subject. To annotate Plato worthily and to illustrate him before Indian readers make perhaps the highest honour and privilege for Indian annotators to possess.

Yours sincerely,

(Sd.) MOHIT CHANDRA SEN (M.A.),

[*Professor of English and Philosophy Govt. College, Hughli.*]

SOCRATES

CHAPTER I.

A BRIEF SURVEY OF SOCRATES' LIFE.

Singularity of Socrates. Socrates with his unique method of searching cross-examination of men was a conspicuous figure of ancient Greek history.

Paucity of Materials of Socrates' life. We are completely ignorant of that portion of Socrates' life which preceded his public career. Later writers tell us a number of unauthenticated stories about him, but Xenophon and Plato are the only two trustworthy biographers of Socrates.

Date of his Birth and Parentage. About the year 469 B. C. Socrates was born at Athens. His father Sophroniscus was a sculptor, and his mother, Phæonarte, a midwife.

The Period he flourished in. (1) *The intellectual surroundings.* The splendid period of the Greek history (B. C. 460-420) in which Socrates flourished, was marked by the greatest intellectual activity of the Athenians. The greatest dramatists, Æschylus, Sophocles and Eurypides—Pheidias, the great sculptor—Pericles, the great statesman and orator—Thucydides, the great historian, and Ictinius, the great architect,—all flourished in and about this glorious period, and made Athens the centre of all Greek wisdom. (2) *The political institutions of Athens.* Athens founded a new empire, by being the head of the Confederacy of Delos. The sovereign power of the State was vested in the Popular Assembly of Athens, and the people received a solid intellectual training by actively taking part in all the affairs of the State. (3) *The Athenian Judicial System,* consisting

chiefly of juries (dicastery) in which the people had to take part by turns, also imparted intellectual training to them.

Extent of Socrates' Knowledge. The influences under which Socrates had to pass the first 50 years of his life, contributed greatly to the development of his mind. Of the extent of his positive knowledge and formal training very little is known. As usual, he received the Athenian liberal education in music and gymnastics. Xenophon represents him as thoroughly acquainted with the works of Prodicus, a Sophist, and the Seven Sages of Greece, and possessing some knowledge of mathematics, including higher geometry and astronomy and the doctrines of the cosmical philosophers (like Parmenides, Heraclitus, Anaxagoras) that preceded him. There is, however, no historical basis of the statement, made in the *Phædo*, that he had a passion for the study of nature. Socrates condemned the conclusions of natural sciences as erroneous, impious and fruitless, but he acknowledged their utility in men's every-day concerns.

Socrates on Military Service. Between B. C. 432-429, Socrates served as a common soldier at the siege of Potidæa, at the battle of Delium (424 B. C.), and at the battle of Amphipolis (422 B. C.) On all these occasions he exhibited an undaunted spirit, and an extraordinary degree of endurance.

Socrates Caricatured by Aristophanes. *The Clouds* of Aristophanes was first acted in 423 B. C. Aristophanes, who was an admirer of the good old days of Athens, hated the new critical spirit of the age. Socrates was selected as the principal figure of his caricature, probably on account of his ugly bodily features and shabby dress. The picture of Socrates as drawn by Aristophanes, is a grotesque blending of the caricatures of the Cosmical philosophers and of the Sophists.

✓ **The Clouds.** Socrates is represented as a miserable recluse, announcing the dethronement of Zeus, and the

accession of Rotation in his place, and invoking as a votary such other divinities as Air, Ether, the Clouds, and the Tongue. He helps a debtor to deceive his creditors, by teaching him and his son the art of specious reasoning. Thus trained, the son beats his father, and threatens to beat his mother, and justifies his conduct on plausible grounds.

✓ **The Clouds—an unjust Caricature.** The *Clouds* is a grossly absurd and unmerited attack upon Socrates; but it is the embodiment of the prejudices of the people against him. In the *Apology* Socrates defends himself against the charges thus laid at his door. The *Clouds* establishes at least one fact—that early in 423 B. C., Socrates made himself a renowned man.

Socrates' Moral Courage. (1) After the battle of *Arginusæ* (B. C. 406), the Athenian generals were severely denounced by the people for their neglecting to perform due funeral rites to the bodies of the dead. The people were so impatient that they proposed in the Assembly that all the generals should be condemned in one sentence, which was contrary to the law of Attica. Socrates, who happened to be on the day of the trial the *Epistates*, or the Speaker of the Assembly, strongly opposed this proposal and refused to put it to the vote, in spite of being threatened by the infuriated mob even with death. (2) During the oppressive rule of the Thirty Tyrants, he was ordered to bring one Leon over from Salamis to Athens for being put to death. Socrates disregarded this order of the Tyrants, although he knew that it might result in his death. (3) Socrates incurred the anger of the Thirty Tyrants for openly denouncing their indiscriminate murders. He was sent for by them, and forbidden, on pain of death, to converse with the young. Socrates maintained a fearless attitude in the council of the Tyrants, and practically disobeyed their orders.

Socrates' Marriage with Xanthippe. No date can be assigned to Socrates' marriage with Xanthippe, whose name has become a by-word for a shrew. By her he had three sons, Lamprocles, Sophroniscus, Menexenus. He never enjoyed domestic happiness.

Socrates' Career as a Reformer commenced. The Delphic Oracle declared that Socrates was the wisest of all men. This event, to which no date can be assigned, was the turning point of his life, and led him to test the truth of the Oracle by examining every one he met with. But the real purpose of his cross-examination was to expose the hollowness of what passed for wisdom, and to prepare the soil for a true scientific knowledge.

Probable Date of his new Career. It is certain that as early as 423 B. C., the date of the publication of the *Clouds*, Socrates made himself famous with his peculiar method of cross-examination.

Socrates and the Sophists contrasted. The Sophists who were teachers of superficial wisdom by profession, and who cared for nothing but money, and so were hunters of rich young men, formed a striking contrast to Socrates—an unassuming man spending his whole life in helping others to be convinced of their own ignorance, by his cross-examination, taking no fees for his labour, and making no distinction between the rich and the poor.

Plato on Socrates, in his "Symposium." Plato, in his *Symposium*, has put into the mouth of Alcibiades, a glowing account of Socrates' character. There Socrates, with his rough exterior and excellent virtues at bottom, is compared to the Statue of a Silenus. For the wonderful force of his words, he is likened to Marsyas, the great piper. Alcibiades is made to acknowledge that the discourses of Socrates would produce upon his mind the feelings of shame and self-reproach, at his own unscrupulous course of life,

Socrates' Endurance and Courage. (1) During the siege of Potidæa, Socrates showed an extraordinary degree of endurance of the privations consequent upon the scantiness of provisions, and the severity of the Thracian winter. (2) After the battle of Delium, when the Athenians were seized with a universal panic, and were put to flight, Socrates alone remained firm, and assumed a desperate and majestic attitude which struck both friends and foes with awe.

Socrates pronounced Unrivalled in Originality. Alcibiades is made to declare Socrates as above comparison, in respect of originality, with any other man, living or dead. He seems to be talking about common-places, which are really full of deep significance to all intelligent hearers.

Socrates Accused, Tried, and Condemned. In 399 B. C. Socrates was accused of corrupting young men, and of not believing in the gods of the Athenians. He was found guilty and condemned to death, the execution of which was put off for 30 days on account of the Delian festival.

CHAPTER II.

SOCRATES AS A THINKER.

The Pre-Socratic Philosophers. The Pre-Socratic philosophers cultivated physics and metaphysics. They tried to find out some *fundamental principle* or *basal element*, such as Air, Fire, Water, &c., in order to solve the problem of the creation of the universe. *Philosophical enquiries begun.* When Athens grew into an empire, and showed great intellectual activity, moral and political enquiries began to be made, and physical speculations fell into discredit. The questions of right and wrong, the

good and the expedient, justice and injustice, etc., were now discussed, though in an unscientific way.

The Rise of the Sophists. The Sophists, who now succeeded the Cosmical philosophers, met the new demand for political and ethical discussions to a certain extent, and in a superficial way. Their rise dates the new intellectual movement at Athens. But they made a great error in readily accepting and teaching an unexamined mass of confused opinions on Ethics and Politics that passed current amongst the Athenians; and in considering that knowledge consisted in being able to satisfy the caprices of the people.

The Advent of Socrates. When the new intellectual movement fully grew into maturity, Socrates appeared on the stage. Like the Sophists, he also dealt with ethical and political questions.

The views of Socrates and his Predecessors compared. (1) In respect of subject-matter, there was a difference between the Cosmical philosophers and Socrates, the former dealing with *nature*, the latter with *man*. (2) Between the Sophists and Socrates there was an agreement in subject-matter, both dealing with *man*; but there was a difference in method, the Sophists handling their subject in an unscientific way, Socrates, - with logical accuracy and precision.

Socrates the first Framer of Definition and Induction. Aristotle says, 'Induction and Definition of general terms may fairly be ascribed to Socrates.'

Socrates, a Reformer of Words and Thoughts. Until Socrates' time, people used general terms with no definite signification attached to them. This inaccurate use of language and consequent intellectual confusion widely prevailed amongst all classes of people at Athens. He found everywhere a 'conceit of knowledge,' without the reality. Socrates with his method of cross-examination tried to rectify these errors of the people. The *Euthyphron* best exemplifies the work of Socrates in this direction.

Socrates' Morality. The attainment of uncompromising truth was the motto of his life. He considered it a supreme duty to do right for its own sake, and not for expediency. In the *Crito*, Socrates discusses the question of the rightness or wrongness of evading the penalty awarded by the law. [According to Xenophon, Socrates' standard of goodness or badness of an act is its expediency or in expediency.] He firmly believed that he was entrusted by God with the duty of reforming men's thoughts and morals.

Socrates' Conception of Reform. The principles of Socrates' reform were to make the Athenians conscious of their own ignorance, and to reconstruct the opinions of man upon the sounder basis of reason. His entire teaching hinged upon his doctrine—"Virtue is knowledge." Accordingly he believed that vice was the result of ignorance, and that a man could not but do right, provided he comprehended it fully as such. He considered knowledge, not as a part of, but identical or co-incident with, virtue.

Socrates' Conception of Virtue Criticised. Socrates makes virtue purely intellectual, and ignored the essential (*viz.*, emotional and volitional) element of virtue. His idea of virtue is therefore defective, because it puts a part for the whole.

Socrates' Method. The first step he adopted was destructive. It consisted in convincing men of their vanity and ignorance, by means of cross-examination. What had hitherto been universally accepted as true was now put to a severe test by Socrates. Whenever Socrates heard any one using a general or abstract term, he would invariably ask him to define it. The given definition being applied to particular cases, would closely be analysed, and often found defective; and when, amended by the respondent, would again be found fault with by Socrates, till at last the respondent was driven to commit shameful self-contradictions. This is what is called the *elenchos* or cross-examination of Socrates. The *Euthyphron* of Plato, and the dialogue bet-

ween Socrates and Euthydemus, as recorded by Xenophon, are the best specimens of this method.

Negative Character of Socrates' Philosophy. Plato lays great stress upon the *negative* and *destructive* aspect of Socrates' philosophy. It is doubtful whether Socrates at all constructed a positive philosophical system of his own to replace the appearance of knowledge that passed current among the men of the age, although Xenophon represents him as framing certain definitions, which were undoubtedly intended as answering the purpose of illustrations. He emphatically asserted that he never taught any one. His object was not to teach, but to create a philosophical mood in the minds of all.

His Professions of Ignorance, Sincere. Although he called himself a philosopher (by which term he meant a lover of wisdom), yet he was conscious of his own ignorance. Knowledge to him was a problem too deep for any solution, under ordinary circumstances.

The Socratic Irony. His famous irony will be best appreciated, if it is borne in mind that he was perfectly sincere in considering himself ignorant. The ignorance professed by him was not used for making the conversation amusing and the defeat of the opponent more complete. The last sentences of the *Euthyphron* are feigned and bitterly ironical, as the respect shown towards Euthyphron was a sort of mock deference, accompanied with a consciousness of his own superiority.

The Socratic Philosophy Criticised. *Socrates committed some palpable mistakes*—(1) In calling a man ignorant unless he could give an account of what he knew, thus ignoring what is called an *implicit knowledge*. (2) In making knowledge identical or co-incident with virtue (of which it is no doubt an essential part), thus putting a part for the whole (3) In unjustly censuring poets by judging poetry from a purely intellectual point of view.

Merits in spite of Defects. In spite of errors and defects, the value of Socrates' services to posterity

SOCRATES.

cannot be too highly praised. He framed definitions at a time when they were not known at all. He was the first to conceive the possibility of ethics, political science and logic, and Aristotle the greatest of the Greek philosophers, was the offspring of the labours of Socrates.

CHAPTER III.

AN ABSTRACT OF SOME OF PLATO'S DIALOGUES ON SOCRATES.

THE EUTHYPHRON.

Euthyphron, an Athenian, who boasts of having possessed a thorough knowledge of divine things, is surprised to meet Socrates at the King's Porch, as he cannot believe that Socrates has a case pending there. Socrates having informed Euthyphron of his being accused by one Meletus, of impiety and corrupting the young, is, in turn, apprised that Euthyphron has indicted his own father for the murder of a slave. Euthyphron having expressed his confidence that his present act is a holy one, Socrates asks him what *holiness* or *piety* is. Euthyphron at once replies: "Piety is acting as I now do, *i. e.*, punishing an evil-doer, even though he be your own father, as Zeus punished his father Cronos for a crime." Socrates rejects such stories as untrue and atrocious, and demands the right answer, of Euthyphron, to the question. Of Euthyphron's definition of "Piety" as that which is pleasing to the gods, a flaw is at once detected, and Euthyphron, changing ground, again defines "Piety as that which is pleasing to all the gods." Socrates demolishes this definition also, and Euthyphron has by this time been completely puzzled by Socrates' cross-examination. Thus confused, he does not understand the suggestion of Socrates that piety is a part of justice.

He then defines "Piety as that part of justice which has to do with the care of the gods," and is compelled to admit that "Piety is an art of traffic between the gods and men." This will not stand. The Gods gain nothing, but are pleased with the marks of honour and gratitude, and piety therefore must be that which is pleasing to the gods. This is the same definition which was rejected as insufficient. A fresh definition being demanded, Euthyphron breaks off the dialogue.

Remarks upon the Euthyphron. (1) This dialogue is a specimen of the Socratic method of cross-examination. (2) It is a matter of doubt whether the conversation herein recorded ever actually took place. (3) Socrates' dislike of the tales about the crimes of the gods is worth noticing. (4) The real question discussed herein is not whether Euthyphron's act is justifiable or not, but whether Euthyphron is clever enough to justify it.

THE APOLOGY.

Socrates' Indictment. In 399 B. C., Socrates was indicted before an Athenian *dicastery*, consisting probably of 501 *dicasts* or *jurors*, for not believing in the gods of the Athenians and for corrupting young men, by Meletus, a poet, Lycon, a rhetorician, and Anytus, a rich leather-seller and a powerful demagogue. The charges contained nothing more than those commonly brought against the Sophists and the Cosmical philosophers.

The Procedure of Trial at Athens. The time assigned to a trial was divided into three equal lengths. (a) The first length was occupied by the speeches of the accusers; (b) The second, by the speeches of the accused or of his friends; (c) The third, by the speech of the prosecutor, advocating the penalty proposed by him. The accused was allowed to propose a counter-penalty lighter than the one proposed. (The first 24 chapters of the *Apology*). The accused was allowed to bring to the court his children and wives, for exciting the pity of the dicasts. (Chs. xxv—

xxviii). Then the judges had to choose one of the two penalties proposed. If the accused was condemned to death, he was led away to prison by the *eleven* (xxviii).

N.B.—It is doubtful whether the bold address contained in the last portion of the *Apology* was ever allowed to have been delivered.

The Defence of Socrates at the Trial. Socrates divides his accusers into two classes:—(1) Those old calumniators who have been accusing him of being a wicked sophist and a natural philosopher combined in one. Socrates attributes his unpopularity to his method of cross-examination. Aristophanes belongs to this class. (2) The new accusers, like Meletus, and his companions. Meletus, being cross-examined and exposed, is made to contradict himself. Socrates asserts his unwillingness to continue to live at the sacrifice of his duty, and shows no submission to the judges, and challenges every one present to come forward and verify the charge of corrupting the young. He will not appear to the pity of the judges, it being considered unworthy both of himself and of the judges, to whom and to God he commits his cause, for final disposal. At this period, he is condemned by 281 to 220. After Meletus' speech advocating his penalty, Socrates speaks again, saying that the condemnation is what he has expected, but he deserves reward for his labours as a public benefactor, in the shape of maintenance at public cost in the *Prytaneum* of Athens. He does not, however, object to the payment of a fine at the request of his friends. The sentence of death is passed, and thus ends the trial, after which Socrates denounces those who have condemned him, and assures those that have acquitted him that death is not a loss, but a gain, it being either an eternal sleep and a sweet oblivion, or a journey to another better world, where he expects to meet the gods and the demigods.

Remarks on the "Apology." The "Apology," how far an utterance of Socrates. It is impossible to single out those portions of the *Apology* that are Socrates' actual utterances. Riddel points out that, (1) The struc-

ture of the defence is the work of Plato ; the *Apology* is artistic to the core and is full of subtle rhetoric ; *e.g.*, his attack upon his old calumniators is virtually an attack upon the Athenians in general, masked for fear of offending them seriously. (2) It is full of rhetorical common places. The exordium may be closely paralleled from the orators. (3) The style and language is Plato's.

The Beauties of the *Apology*. The *Apology* holds before us an ideal picture of Socrates, showing—(1) The dignified attitude taken by him before the judges. (2) A liberal contempt arising, not from pride, but from the magnanimity of his soul. (3) Repeated instances of graceful irony and self appreciation, and consequent reluctance of urging all the considerations which are regarded as beyond the comprehension of the judges. (4) His singularity of ways and thoughts. (5) A bold assertion of private judgment against authority, in defiance of consequences. (6) His disapproval of the Democracy of Athens. (7) A deep religiousness, marked by resignation, and a firm conviction of the eternal existence of the soul.

N. B.—As Plato was present at the trial, his report is expected to be, in the main, true, although it is not literal.

Socrates on the Athenian Democracy. Xenophon says that Socrates was charged with bringing the constitution into contempt. In fact, all popular government was not in keeping with his intellectual position. The art of government, according to him, required a thorough intellectual training and discipline. Socrates therefore preferred a higher form of aristocracy composed of well-educated chosen men to *democracy* or government of the mob.

The real Cause of his Unpopularity. The most sacred feeling of the Athenians was shocked at the attack of Socrates on the established opinions on human affairs, which represented the time-honoured *unwritten law* of the State. By the Athenians, the State was not merely

feared, but was also revered, as it had a two-fold function, secular and religious. Hence the fury of the popular animosity against him.

Socrates' Religion. The religion of Socrates was not the polytheistic and mythological system which was prevalent amongst the Greeks. (See *Euthyphron*). The God of Socrates (as well as of Plato) is all-good and true, never changing himself into diverse forms, and never deceiving others. He alone is wise and omniscient, and protects good men from evil. He communicates his will to men through dreams and oracles, and the priestess at Delphi is his mouthpiece. His laws and commands must be obeyed at all costs.

The Dæmon or Divine Sign of Socrates. Socrates believed that he had certain special and peculiar intimations from God through his *Divine Sign*. Xenophon and later writers have represented it as the *Dæmon* or *Genius of Socrates*. It always restrained him from doing certain actions, but never acted in the way of instigation. The question of the exact nature of this *Divine Sign* is a puzzling one. That it is not *conscience* is clear from the following facts:—(1) It dealt, not with the *morality*, but with the *expediency* of actions. (2) *Conscience* is both *positive* and *negative*, but this *divine sign* was only *negative*. (3) It was possessed only by Socrates, whereas *conscience* is a property common to all. Modern critics are of opinion that it was a quick and spontaneous exercise of judgment, moral or otherwise, coupled with a special knowledge of the subject under consideration, a varied experience, and an almost unerring inference from cause to effect.

THE CRITO.

The Scene of the *Crito* is laid in the prison where Socrates is confined for 30 days for the Delian festival. Crito, a well-to-do friend of Socrates, comes to the prison and offers that he will make, with his money, all necessary

arrangements for his escape, should he only consent to it. Socrates then holds a discussion with him on the duty of a citizen to the State, and convinces Crito that it will be wrong on his part to evade the penalty that the law has inflicted upon him, and that it is his duty to abide by the decision of the law, even at the sacrifice of his life, as in the present case, because he owes everything—his birth, education, life, children, property, etc.—entirely to the law, and he has had ample time (it being his 70th year) to consider the propriety of continuing to live under it at Athens. The fact of his not changing the State for another implies his assent to its constitution and law. He will not go to other countries, and had he wished it, the penalty of banishment might be secured from the judges in all fairness. He is therefore prepared to abide by the decision of the law to the end.

Remarks on the Crito. It is doubtful whether the incident recorded in this dialogue ever occurred. It is not strange that Plato invented it; but it is certain that Socrates' friends would surely have liked to see him live, and would have proposed escape to him.

THE PHÆDO.

The Scene and Preliminary Incidents described. This dialogue contains the story of Socrates' death as related by Phædo, who had been present at the death-scene of his master, to Echecrates of Philus and others. Touching upon the circumstances under which Socrates' death was put off for 30 days, Phædo proceeds to describe the incidents that occurred in the prison itself. The day on which he is to die, Socrates is released from fetters, and remarks on the close relation between pleasure and pain, while rubbing his leg with his hand; and Xanthippe, who soon goes away lamenting, is sitting by him. While speaking of Evenus, Socrates remarks that a philosopher should not commit suicide, but should always long to die.

Death is highly acceptable to wise men, because it sets the soul free from the bondage of the body, which always proves an obstacle to the soul in her search after truth. .

Cebes' Objection to the Immortality of the Soul. Cebes, one of his associates, present at the death-scene, fears that the soul vanishes with the destruction of the body.

Socrates Discusses the Immortality of the Soul.

(1) Socrates urges that opposites are generated from opposites, and so life from death. If it were not so, everything would be dead in the long run. (2) He then makes use of the *Platonic Doctrine of Reminiscence*. All our knowledge is a re-awakening of what we have known in a state previous to our birth. The souls of men therefore must have existed before they migrated into the material bodies.

Simmius' Objection. Simmius, another associate of Socrates, accepting this doctrine, wants a further proof that the soul will continue to exist after death.

Socrates' Argument in Reply. Socrates replies by saying that the soul is simple and unchanging, while the body is changing and a compound. The soul is therefore less subject to decay than the body. Even the perishable body can virtually be made almost immortal by embalming it after death. It is not therefore possible that the soul, which is akin to the divine, will vanish away before the dissolution of the body. The pure soul, on the contrary, goes to another world to live with the gods and the demigods. The impure soul, on account of too much communion with matter, "imbodies and imbrutes, till she quite loses the divine property of her first being." The souls of the ordinary or unphilosophical men migrate after death into the bodies of different animals.

Simmius' Objection further stated. Simmius considers the soul to be a harmony of the elements of the body, as a musical harmony is to a lyre. Just as a musical harmony, though diviner than the lyre, does not survive it, so the soul, which is diviner than the body, does not continue to exist after its destruction.

Cebes' fresh Objection. The soul is admitted to be more enduring than the body, but that does not necessarily prove her immortality.

Socrates refutes the Argument of Harmony.

(1) Had the soul been a harmony of the elements of the body she would not have existed before the elements which compose her. (2) The soul leads the elements, but a harmony is led. (3) Harmony admits of a variation in degree or pitch, but the soul does not admit of any such variation.

Socrates meets Cebes' Objection. In order to meet the argument of Cebes, Socrates investigates the question of generation and decay, or the theory of causation. He unfolds the three intellectual changes through which his own mind has passed:—(1) In his youth he had a passion for the study of nature. He dealt with the mechanical and physical causes of the philosophers, but was puzzled. (2) He hoped that Anaxagoras would propound a right exposition of the problem of causation, as he said that *Mind* was the universal cause. But Socrates was disappointed. Instead of mind, *air, ether, etc.*, were introduced as the causes of things. (3) He at last studied the subject independently, and arrived at the conclusion that *Absolute Ideas* are the causes of all phenomena. Taking his stand upon this *Doctrine of Ideas*, Socrates shows that—(a) *Ideas*, opposite in nature, cannot co-exist in the same person or thing. (b) An idea will not only admit its opposite; it will not admit that which is inseparable from its opposite. (c) So life is the opposite of death, and life is inseparable from the soul. Therefore the soul will not admit death. The soul is immortal and therefore indestructible.

The Myth of the Phædo. After giving a description of the soul's journey to the other world, Socrates comes to the description of the earth in the famous *Myth of the Phædo*. (a) He describes the earth, its shape, character, inhabitants, and beauty. We men live in a hollow, like the fishes in the sea, while other men live on the surface, which is far more beautiful than our world. (b) He

then describes Tartarus, and its rivers, of which the chief are Oceanus, Acheron, Pyriphlegethon, and Cocytus. (c) He then describes the judgment, rewards and penalties, of the souls after death. A virtuous soul passes on to an infinitely beautiful world, being completely freed from the body.

Socrates' death. Crito asks for the last commands of Socrates and wishes to know how to bury him. Socrates replied: "Only you catch me first." Socrates goes away with Crito to bathe and bids adieu to his family. He then drinks the hemlock calmly, and just a few minutes before his death, he said: "Crito, I owe a cock to Asclepius, do not forget to pay it." Then there was a movement, and thus the noble soul passed away.

Remarks on the Phædo. The tragic sublimity of Socrates' death has been described with a masterly art. The *Phædo* may be divided into two parts—the *historical*, the *philosophical*.

The Historical side. Although Plato was not present at the death-scene, yet we can expect that the account given by him is, in the main, correct.

The Philosophical side. The philosophy of the *Phædo* is Platonic and not Socratic. In this dialogue Plato has represented Socrates as a keen and practised metaphysician. But the real Socrates, as represented in the *Apology* and some other dialogues, and by Xenophon, dealt only with the questions affecting *Man* and *Society*. Socrates is not known as the author of any positive philosophical system, but only as the first man who conceived the very idea of scientific knowledge. In the *Phædo*, the immortality of the soul is ultimately proved by the doctrine of Ideas. But Aristotle says that the doctrine of Ideas was never known to Socrates; it was an advance made by Plato upon his theory of definitions. In fact, Plato in this dialogue, and elsewhere, has made Socrates the mouthpiece of his own opinions and arguments. The greater portion of the conversation recorded in the *Phædo* never took place.

²
⁵
The Conclusion. Socrates was just and heroic in his life and death. He believed that he was sent by God to preach righteousness to his fellow-citizens. Having no definite knowledge of "that undiscovered country from whose bourne no traveller returns," he chose rather to die than to forsake what he considered his duty.

NOTES ON THE TRIAL AND DEATH OF SOCRATES.

THE APOLOGY.

Apology—Defence or vindication of one's own conduct.
What impression.....upon you—How far you have been influenced by hearing of the charges brought against me by my prosecutors. *For my own part*—As regards myself. *They nearly.....they*—Their arguments which were only seemingly reasonable were so effectively used that even I myself was confounded as to the real nature of my own self. *Clever speaker*—An artful speaker using specious arguments so as to deceive others.—*You...ye*—The Athenians. *Impudent of you*—Impertinent on your part. *As soon.....the truth*—As soon as I shall begin to speak before you the falsehood of their statements will at once be detected, i.e., it will clearly be proved that I am not at all a clever speaker, as they represented me to be, unless by "clever speaking" they meant declarations of truth, which, of course, I actually make; i.e., in this sense of cleverness, I am certainly a clever speaker, because I speak truth and nothing but truth. *The whole truth*—Truth in its entirety; truth unmixed with the least tinge of falsehood. *Elaborate speech.....phrases*—Long and laboured speech artistically arranged in beautiful words and phrases.

Cf., Shakespeare:—

I come not, friends, to steal away your hearts;

I am no orator, as Brutus is;

But as you know me all, a plain blunt man

That love my friends...

For I have neither wit, nor the power of speech

To stir men's blood; I only speak right on;

I tell you that which you yourselves do know.

Julius Caesar, Act III, Sc. 3.

I will say.....else—I will give you a speech *extempore*, i.e., without any previous preparation whatever, and I will explain myself in a plain blunt way and in a language which comes of itself or spontaneously, for I am of conviction that I shall have to plead a just cause and to speak the truth, which requires no premeditation.

Page 36.

So let.....else—When I have to speak the truth I can produce no rhetoric or pompous display of choicest words and phrases, as truth is always unassuming. *Seemly*—Becoming; proper. *Specious*—Apparently true. *I am accustomed.....elsewhere*—Socrates was to be found in any part of Athens always engaged with persons of all rank in talking on subjects of virtue and morality. *Your manner of speech*—The style of speaking prevalent in the courts of law. *That is what.....advocate*—The merit of a judge consists in paying attention, not to the manner of speaking but to the spirit, i.e., whether a man speaks right or wrong; while that of a good pleader consists in speaking the truth, for the cause of an advocate (however clever he may be) which has no truth at its bottom, cannot stand the test. Cf., the saying, "Falsehood has no legs." *Old false charges of my old accusers*—Accusations brought against me (though not in a court) long ago by my old enemies. Here he refers to Aristophanes and others who ridiculed him in their comedies. *I fear them.....Anytus*—Because the impressions made by them upon the minds of the people are deep-rooted, and are existing for a very long time. *Formidable as they are*—Powerful although they are. *Those others*—i.e., my old enemies.

Page 37.

Got hold of most of you—Occupied, or exercised an irresistible influence upon, the minds of almost all of you. *Persistent*—Systematically persevering. *There is one Socrates a wiseman.....reason*—There is a philosopher

named Socrates, who meditates on the nature and origin of the "starry world," and who investigates into the nature of all things underneath the surface of the earth, and who is so clever a rhetorician that he can make the unsound arguments appear to be perfectly reasonable. The quotation comes from Milton's description of Belial, a fallen angel and associate of Satan in Hell:—

"But all was false and hollow, though his tongue

Dropt manna and could make the worse appear the better reason....."—*Paradise Lost*, 11.

For Socrates' alleged speculations about the heavens read the following scene of Aristophanes' *Clouds*:

[Strepsiadès in order to learn the best way of paying old debts comes to the "thinking shop" of Socrates, the door of which opens and the pupils of Socrates are seen all with their heads fixed on the ground, while Socrates himself is seen suspended in the air in a basket]. The following conversation then ensues:—

Str.—O Hercules, from what country are these wild beasts? *Student*—They are in search of the things below the earth. *Str.*—Then they are searching for roots! Do not, then, trouble yourselves about this; for I know where there are large and fine ones. Why, what are these doing, who are bent down so much? *Stud.*—They are groping about in darkness under Tartarus. *Str.*—Why then does their ramp look towards heaven? *Stud.*—It is getting taught astronomy itself. *Str.*—But who hangs dangling in the basket yonder? *Stud.*—Himself. *Str.*—And who's himself? *Stud.*—Why, Socrates. *Str.*—Ho, Socrates!—call him, you fellow, call loud. *Stud.*—Call him yourself. I've got no time for calling (exit indoors). *Str.*—Ho, Socrates! Sweet, darling Socrates! *Soc.*—Why callest thou me poor creature of day? *Str.*—First tell me, pray, what are you doing up there? *Soc.*—I walk in the air, and contemplate the sun. *Str.*—Oh, that's the way that you look down upon the gods from your basket, and not from the earth—oh?

Soc.—I never could have found out things divine

Had I not hung my mind up thus and mixed
 My subtle intellect with its kindred air.
 Had I regarded such things from below
 I had learnt nothing. For the earth absorbs
 Into itself the moisture of the brain.
 It is the very same case with water-cresses.

Str.—Dear me ! So water-cresses grow by thinking !

That person...gods—That those who investigate such matters of this world do not believe in the gods, *i.e.*, the physical philosophers must be atheists by virtue of their investigations into the phenomena of nature. Anaxagoras was therefore accused by the Athenians of atheism. *When you...them*—When you were at a tender age and when you were apt to believe them readily, for want of a mature power of discrimination. *Comic poets*—Poets writing comedies or caricatures. *To prejudice you against me*—To make you form an unfavourable opinion of me. *Spite*—Malice, illfeeling. *From conviction*—From a sincere belief as to the injuriousness of my teachings. *Call forward*—Summon.

I have as it were...defence—Although I am aware of the charges that were brought against me on previous occasions, yet I do not know the names even of my accusers, so that in going to defend my conduct against the charges of such persons I have to fight with unsubstantial and airy beings, so to say.

Page 38.

Leave—Permission. *Persistent*—Obstinate. *Prejudice*—Unfavourable opinion formed without sufficient evidence. *If it be good for you and for me*—"If it were at all better both for you and me." (Cary's version). *Be the issue...defence*—"Nevertheless let this turn out as may be pleasing to God, I must obey the law and make my defence" (Cary). *Has given rise to*—Brought about; produced. *Drew his indictment*—Preferred his charges. *Spreading*—Circulating. *Formally*—In obedience to due forms or procedure. *It would...fashion*—It would read almost to this effect. *Meddles*—Interferes.

Page 39.

The comedy of Aristophanes—i.e. The Clouds, for details see Intro., Page 3. Swinging round in a basket—Cf., “But who hangs dangling in the basket yonder?”—(See p. 37). Saying that he walked the air—Cf.,—“I walk the air, and contemplate the sun.” Nonsense—Absurdities. Disparage—Undervalue; underestimate. That kind of knowledge—i.e., knowledge about nature (seriously speaking). If there...it—If it be possible for any existing man to have been endowed with such knowledge. I have nothing to do with—I am not at all concerned in. Such matters—About the phenomena of nature. Common—Current. Undertake to educate men—To take upon myself the charge of teaching others. Exact—To take by force.

Gorgias—A celebrated sophist and orator of the school of Empidocles, was a native of Leontinum in Sicily. A golden statue was erected to his honour at Delphi. Plato has given his name to one of his dialogues. Lived 417 B.C.

Prodicus—A sophist and rhetorician who taught at Athens and had for disciples Euripides, Socrates, Isocrates and Xenophon. The Athenians put him to death on pretence that he corrupted the morals of their youth. He was a native of Cos and a disciple of Protagoras. Flourished 435 B.C.

Hippias—A philosopher of Elis, who maintained that virtue consisted in not being in want of the assistance of men. *For each of them...themselves*—Cf., Cary's version, “For each of these, O Athenians, is able, by going through the several cities, to persuade the young men who can attach themselves gratuitously to such of their own fellow-citizens, as they please, to abandon their fellow-citizens and associate with them, giving them money and thanks besides.” *Wise man*—Sophist.

Page 40.

Paros—An island in the Ægean Sea, famous in anci-

ent times for marble quarries. *Foal*—Young of a horse. *Excellence.....nature*—Qualities which appertain to their own respective natures (*viz.*, of foals or calves). *He*—The trainer. *Take*—Engage as tutor. *Seeing that*—Considering that. *Who understands the excellence..... citizens?*—Is there any man who is competent to appreciate the good qualities which peculiarly belong to men, as members of society and of constitutional governments of States? *This*—*i.e.*, the necessity of the training of children. *Because of your sons*—Because you have sons. *Such a person*—Such a person competent to be teacher.

Evenus (see p. 110)—A poet of Paros. *Five mina*—“The Greek or Attic *mina* was valued at a hundred drachmas, more than £3 sterling” (Webster). *Given myself airs etc....it*—(Of, Cary’s version: “And I too should think highly of myself and be very proud, if I possessed this knowledge, but I possess it not, O Athenians.”) *Given myself airs*—Assumed an attitude of haughtiness and self-importance. *What is this pursuit of yours?*—What have you been doing all this time? *Engaged*—Occupied. *Some pursuit out of the common*—Some business, singular in character, or deviating from the ordinary groove. *Gone about*—Been circulated; got abroad. *Different*—Singular.

Page 41.

That we may.....dark—So that we may pass our judgment, being fully apprised of the nature of your pursuit, and all doubts regarding it having been fully removed. *A certain wisdom*—Wisdom of a peculiar kind. *That wisdom.....man*—That wisdom which man can attain to in this life, as opposed to the perfect wisdom which philosophers enjoy after death. *In that*—So far as this kind of knowledge is concerned. *The man*—*i.e.*, Evenus of Paros. *Must be wise*—Otherwise he would not have won such a wide-spread reputation. *Slander*—Calumniate. *Credit*—Credence; trust or reliance. *The God of Delphi*—Apollo.

He went into exile With the people.—During the “Reign of Terror” of the Thirty Tyrants nearly 1,400 Ath-

DEATH OF SOCRATES.

enians fell victims (to bloody executions), and 5,000 emigrated, leaving behind all that they possessed. Even the cities hostile to Athens, such as Thebes and Megara, took pity, like Argos, upon the unhappy exiles, although the Spartans threatened to exact a fine of five talents from any one who should not hand the fugitives over to the Thirty. (*Intro.. page 4*). *Veherent—Enthusiastic. Carrying through—Perfectly accomplishing. Took in hand—Underlook. I entreat.....out—It must be imagined that at the bold assertions of Socrates, there was now a sensation in the court, and the Athenians began to make a loud noise.*

Page 42.

The priestess—The virgin priestess of Apollo in the temple at Delphi, called Pythia. Will confirm...say—Will bear out my statement. Dark saying—Enigma; inexplicable statement. I was at a loss.....meaning—I was in doubt and failed in ascertaining what he meant. Reluctantly Unwillingly. Turned—Engaged myself. Reputed to be—Known to all as. If anywhere—If it were possible in any place whatever. I should.....wrong—"I should confute the oracle." Meaning—Intending. I need not tell you his name—For that would be a breach of the ordinary rules of politeness. Most of all—Above all. Bystanders—Those who were present near them. Any thing that is really good—Anything that is essentially and absolutely good.

Page 43.

I am wiser.....I do not know—The purport is this: Both of us are ignorant, but I am aware of my ignorance, whereas he boasts of his knowledge, having no knowledge at all. My wisdom therefore consists in this that I am conscious of my own ignorance. I went on—I continued to go. I must set.....everything—I must consider the command of God more precious and imperative than anything else in this world.

The dog of Egypt—Anubis, an Egyptian deity, represented under the form of a man with the head of a dog. When Osiris went on his expedition against India, Anubis accompanied him and clothed himself in a sheep's skin. His worship was introduced from Egypt into Greece and Italy. He is supposed by some to be *Mercury*, because he is sometimes represented with a caduceus (wand).

So the duties of Mercury, as of bearing messages of the gods, of conducting the souls of the dead into the infernal regions, etc., are attributed to him. Others make him brother of Osiris. *Looked down on*—Despised.

A series of Heracleian labours—A series of difficult undertakings, like the twelve arduous labours of Heracles or Hercules.

Hercules—A Grecian hero, possessed of the utmost amount of physical strength and vigour that the human frame is capable of. He was the son of Jupiter and *Alcmene*, and was ranked among the gods, after his death, and received divine honours. The Pythian told him if he would serve Eurystheus for twelve years, he should become immortal; accordingly he bound himself to the Argive king, who imposed upon him twelve (12) tasks of great difficulty and danger:—

- (1) To slay the Nemean lion.
- (2) To kill the Lernean hydra.
- (3) To catch and retain the Arcadian stag,
- (4) To destroy the Eurymanthian boar.
- (5) To cleanse the stables of King Augeas.
- (6) To destroy the cannibal birds of the lake Stymphalis.
- (7) To take captive the Cretan bull.
- (8) To catch horses of the Thracian Diomedes.
- (9) To get possession of the girdle of Hippolyte, the queen of the Amazons.
- (10) To take captive the oxen of the monster Geryon.

wise. *He, i.e., God (Apollo). Men's wisdom...nothing—* That which is called wisdom by men is worthless; it has no worth at all. *As though—As if. In very truth....at all—In reality. On the part of—In behalf* of God, because he was authorized, as it were, to act in His behalf. *In this pursuit—In this my mission. Public matters—Affairs of the State. Look after—To manage; take care of. By reason of—On account of.*

Page 46.

Spare time—Leisure. Try their hands—Experiment upon their skill or dexterity in. *In fact—Really. Abominable fellow—A most contemptible fellow. Not to seem at a loss—In order to keep up appearances; in order to show that he was not at all disconcerted or puzzled. They repeat...philosophers—They reproduce the common charges that are brought against all philosophers and sophists, without being able to refer to any specific charge against me. For, I fancy...possess—They do this, simply to conceal their own humiliation under which they really smart and so to pocket insults, for they do not like to acknowledge the fact of their being exposed as to the hollowness of their pretensions to knowledge which they do not really possess. Zealous—Enthusiastic in systematically preaching against me. Disciplined—Drilled, trained. Plausible—Seemingly reasonable. On the part of—On behalf of. Anytus —Politician, because Anytus himself was a powerful demagogue, and rich leather-seller. Lycon—Was an orator or rhetorician.*

Page 47.

Able to remove—Successful in clearing off. Strong—Deep-rooted. Plainness—Straightforwardness. But that...true—The fact that the words used by me for exposing others' defects make me so many enemies is a sufficient evidence that what I say is true, otherwise people would not have been so much displeased at false statements about them. And that the.....said—Cf. Cary's version:

"And that this is the nature of the calumny against me and that these are its causes." *Look for*—Investigate; enquire into. *Suffice*—Be sufficient. *The city*—The citizens. *Divinities*—Lesser gods and goddesses. *He is playing off a solemn jest*—"He jests on serious subjects." "Solemn jest" is rather paradoxical, meaning light jest on grave subjects. *Lightly*—Without any grave cause. *Pretending.....thought*—"Under pretence of being zealous and solicitous about a thing in which he never at any time took any concern" (*Cary*).

Page 48.

You take that—"For it is evident that you know, since it concerns you so much" (*Cary*). *Reveal to the judges*—"Say and inform the judges." *Scandalous*—Disgraceful. *Conclusive*—Convincing. *Starts*—Begins his task of improving others. *By Here*—A mode of adjuration, by Juno. *The Senators*—The members of the Senate or the Upper Council of Athens.

Page 49.

Assembly—The Popular Assembly or the *Gerusia*. *Make the young...fellows*—Improve the young. There is a tinge of sarcasm here. *The same holds good in*—The same remark is applicable to.

Does one...with them.—The analogy of horses is thus to be applied. Just as it is impossible for one man to do harm to all horses, and all others to improve them, so it is impossible for one man (Socrates) to do harm to all young men and the rest of the world to do them good, as Meletus meant to say. So just on the contrary one man or a few men only who are skilled in horsemanship, can alone improve horses, while the majority of men being unpractised in the art, and having to manage horses sometimes do harm to them, so that man or those men alone who have sincerely devoted themselves to the subject of education, can properly be called teachers, and as such can do good to young men, while the rest of the

world when coming in contact with them can do them no good, but on the contrary do them much injury or corrupt them. So the charge of corrupting young men could not properly be brought against him, as he had sincerely devoted much time to the subject of education, while on the contrary the majority of men, who were unpractised in the art of teaching, could be held guilty of the charge. Thus Socrates rebutted the charge, and turned the tables against Meletus and his party.

Is it.....animal?—The analogy can thus be extended from the case of horses to all other animals. *Of course* (....no—First Socrates asks whether the analogy can be extended or not, but expecting no reasonable reply from Meletus, who obstinately sticks to his own statements without even a show of reason, concludes that the analogy can reasonably be extended whether Meletus and Anytus replied in the affirmative or in the negative. *You prove—* i.e., by your own statements it is proved. *In the matters—viz.,* of moral and religious education of young men.

Page 50.

Who would.....injured—Who would rather like to be injured. *Do you.....intentionally*—Socrates here points out the impudence of the young Meletus who pretends to have a superiority over Socrates in wisdom (who was then aged 70 years), and shows the unreasonableness of his statement that Socrates is guilty of intentionally corrupting his fellow-citizens, with whom he has daily to come in contact and from whom he may always receive injuries. *You are a liar in either case*—You are a liar in both the case; i.e., in holding that I am guilty of corrupting the youth and that I am guilty of the same intentionally. *Call upon*—Necessitate; require. *Involuntary*—Committed not of set purpose (L. in=not, volo=I wish); unintentional. *Take me aside*—Call me in private. *Of course*—As a matter of course, necessarily. *Of course...wrong*—No sooner do I know that I have been doing wrong than I shall desist from unintentional wrong.

doing: (because, according to Socrates, "Knowledge is Virtue." i. e., where there is knowledge there cannot exist wrong-doing, and Virtue of itself must follow. (See *Intro.*, page 8). *You would.....me*—You liked to have had no connection with me.

Page 51.

Bring me.....court—Haul me up or compel me to appear before the court. *New divinities instead*—Now deities whom I am supposed to have introduced in place of those that are worshipped by the Athenians. (See *Intro.*, page 6). *In the name of these gods*—This is sarcastic. *Explain yourself*—Explain your thoughts or ideas. *Absolute atheism*—Total denial of the existence of the gods.

Page 52.

The Sun is a stone.....Earth—The student should remember, as Socrates also points out, that it was the opinion of Anaxagoras, a Cosmical philosopher. (See *Intro.*, page 6). *You must...judges*—Certainly you entertain a very low estimate of the judges here, in believing that they will be easily deceived by so glaring a falsehood as you now set forth by attributing Anaxagoras' doctrines to myself. *Unlettered*—Illiterate; ignorant. *And you...me*—Ironical. *When they...his*—When they can frequent the theatre by paying such a trifling fee as a drachma at most and witness the representation of those plays (of Aristophanes or Euripides) into which the doctrines of Anaxagoras have been introduced, and become so familiarised with them that they may ridicule me even if I pretend to claim those singular doctrines as mine. *Drachma*—"The average value of Attic drachma was 94d. or about 18 cents" (Smith). *Insolent*—impertinent. *Wanton*—Wanting in due restraints upon himself; frivolous or light-hearted. *In the insolence.....youth*—By reason of the impertinence and frivolity natural to the heated blood of young men. *Riddle*—Puzzling problem. *Outwit*—Defeat in wit-combat, by a superior repartee.

Page 53.

Contradict himself—Make two statements that are inconsistent with each other, *Trifling.. Joke.* *At starting*—In the beginning. *And do you...way*—From this sentence it is clear that *those* that were present in the court made, at this stage, noise and interruptions.

Pertaining to—Relating to. *Horsemanship*—The art of training and managing horses with cleverness. *Divine things*—Matters relating to the deities. *Divinities*—In Cary's version this stand as "*demons.*" These demons or genii were reckoned only as the subordinate ministers of the superior deities. *Managed...you*—So contrived as to have an answer from you by force or compulsion. *Statement*—Declaration. *Deposition*—Act of giving testimony under oath; affidavit. *It follows necessarily*—It is, as a matter of course, deducible from that.

Page 54.

'*These divinities,*' etc.—'Demons'—See *ante.* *Illegitimate children*—Children born out of wedlock; natural children. *Nymphs*—Beautiful female deities generally divided into two classes, nymphs of the land and those of the sea. *Not in the existence of the gods, i.e.,* of the parent gods. *Test my skill*—Examine whether I have sufficient intelligence to know your real intention. *But you will...heroes*—In Cary's version the sentence stands thus: "For that you should persuade any man, who has the smallest degree of sense, that the same person can think that there are things relating to demons and to gods, and yet that there are neither demons, nor gods, nor heroes is utterly impossible."

Heroes—Those that were born from a god or that signalled themselves by their actions and seemed to deserve deification and immortality by the services which they had rendered their country. The heroes described by Homer, such as Ajax, Achilles, etc., were possessed of prodigious and superhuman strength.

Page 55.

That—My unpopularity. *They have been...me*—It is on account of the superstition and suspicion of the common people that many good men had to sacrifice their lives before me. That this passage refers to the fate of Palamedes and others like him, will be evident from reference to a passage later on (in p. 77, which runs thus: "And for my part I should have a wonderful interest in meeting there Palamedes, Ajax, the son of Telamon, and the other men of old *who have died through an unjust judgment*, and in comparing my experiences with theirs"). This will be further supported by the following passage from Xenophon's *Defence of Socrates*: "If I die unjustly the shame must be theirs who put me unjustly to death; ...but no disgrace can it bring on me that others have not seen that I was innocent. Palamedes likewise affords me this further consolation; for being like me condemned undeservedly, he furnishes to this day, more noble subjects for praise than the man who had iniquitously caused his destruction." *There is...victim*—In Cary's version we read: "There is no danger that it will stop with me," i.e., the multitude will continue to put good men to death, being blinded by unfounded suspicion and prejudice.

The demigods who died at Troy—The heroes who died at Troy during the great Trojan War. This war has been described by Homer in his great poems, particularly the *Iliad*. Paris, son of Priam, King of Troy, carried off Helen, the beautiful wife of Menelaus, King of Sparta. All the Greek chiefs took this as an outrage committed against themselves, responded to the call of Menelaus, and elected his brother Agamemnon, King of Mycenæ, the leader of an expedition against Troy. Achilles, Ulysses, Ajax, etc., were the most eminent among the Greek heroes, while among the Trojans, Hector, one of Priam's sons, and Æneas, were the most distinguished. Troy yielded after a siege of ten years. In the tenth year Achilles, being offended by Agamemnon,

abstained from the war, so the Greeks were defeated by the Trojans ; and Patroclus, the intimate friend of Achilles, fell during this scuffle, under the spear of Hector. Achilles in order to retaliate upon the death of his dear friend, again appeared in the battle in new and gorgeous armour and slew Hector in single combat. The *Iliad* closes with the burial of Hector: In the meantime, Achilles and other noble heroes had died; and Ulysses accomplished the conquest of Troy. By his advice a wooden horse was built, and within its belly he and other heroes concealed themselves; and the Trojans admitted it within their walls. In the dead of night the Greeks rushed out and opened the gates to their comrades. Thus Troy was taken, and its fall is placed in the year 1184 B.C.

Men of no great worth—Men possessing no superior merit.

The son of Thetis—Achilles—The greatest Greek hero in the Trojan War. His exploits form the subject-matter of Homers's *Iliad*. He slew Hector and thus retaliated upon the death of his friend Patroclus; and in the 10th year of the war he was wounded with an arrow shot by Paris in his vulnerable point of which he died. He was the son of Peleus and Thetis.

Who thought...disgrace—When danger and disgrace were held before him as the two possible courses open he accepted the former, in preference to the latter. This took place not only when he was a full-grown man, but also on another occasion when he was young.

Cf. Lempriere: "When Achilles was young his mother asked him whether he preferred a long life, spent in obscurity and retirement, or a few years of military fame and glory; and that to his honour he made choice of the latter."

He seemed to have said:—

"One crowded hour of glorious life
Is worth an age without a name."

For when his mother...etc.—"His grief (at the death of his friend, Patroclus) is frantic, and heaps dust upon his head. His goddess-mother Thetis "of the silver feet" hears him; and comes with all her train of sea-nymphs to console him. He feels only the loss of Patroclus, and all that he longs for now is vengeance upon Hector. Thetis sorrowfully reminds him that it is written in the book of fate that when Hector falls, his own last hour is near at hand. Be it so, is his reply—death comes in turn to all men, and he will meet it as he may."

Homer (Ancient Classics Series).

Fate awaits the.....death?—You are destined to die, just after the death of Hector.

But he scorned danger and death—*Cf. Pope:—*

"The stroke of fate the bravest cannot shun."

Also Macaulay's Lays of Ancient Rome:—

"To every man upon this earth

Death cometh soon or late

And how can man die better

Than facing fearful odds

For the ashes of his fathers

And the temples of his God."

Straightway—(*adv.*)—immediately.

Page 56.

By the beaked ships.....earth—Beside the ships pointed in the end (like beaks) as an object of universal contempt, and as a burden to the earth, with his existence. *Do you, etc.*—These lines are addressed by Socrates to the Athenians. (He = Achilles). *Post*—Station. *Face*—Encounter, brave.

The Siege of Potidæa.—The Macedonian prince Perdiccas incited the tributaries of Athens upon the coast of Macedonia to revolt, including *Potidæa*, a town seated on the isthmus of Pallene. Potidæa, though now a tributary of Athens, was originally a colony of the Corinthians.

Being urged as well by Perdicas as by the Corinthians, the Potidæans openly raised the standard of revolt (B.C. 432). A powerful Athenian armament was therefore despatched to the coast of Macedonia and laid siege to Potidæa. This, together with other events, immediately gave rise to the Peloponnesian War.

Amphipolis—In the 8th and 9th years of the Peloponnesian War, and immediately after the battle of Delium, the Athenian empire in Thrace was overthrown. Brasidas, the Spartan general, suddenly appeared before Amphipolis, an important Athenian colony on Strymon. The city, allured by the favourable terms offered, surrendered to Brasidas. In the 10th year of the war (B.C. 422) Cleon was sent to recover the Athenian dependencies, and specially Amphipolis. But through the shameful incompetency of Cleon, the Athenians were completely defeated at the battle of Amphipolis. Both Cleon and Brasidas were killed in this battle.

The Battle of Delium—The Athenians planned an expedition against Bœotia, but were defeated with great loss at the battle of Delium (B.C. 424).

Ran the risk of death—Incurred the chance of death. *Desert my post now*—Abandon my mission of examining myself and other men. *Persuaded.....done*—Convinced that he has actually so ordained. *And then*—In that case, i.e., of disobedience to the orders of the God. *With justice*—Justly. *For fear of death.....wise*—Fear of death implies a pretension of knowledge of the mysteries of death. *For any thing.....tell*—In spite of all that is said by man against death. *Greatest good*—"Summum bonum."

Page 57.

Thinking that we know—Pretending to know. *I am different from*—I deviate from the current opinion of. *Mass of mankind*—Generality of men. *The other world*—The next world; hades. *Shrink*—Supply "will never" before it; will never recoil. *Acquit*—Discharge. *Listen*

to—Pay heed to. *As it is*—As the matter stand now. *Forthwith*—Immediately. *Cease.....philosophy*—Desist from the method of your cross-examining others, and your search after truth. *Following.....pursuits*—Practising the same thing, viz., cross-examination and search after truth. *You shall die*—This is a threat; i.e., then there will be no chance of escape. *Terms*—Conditions, stipulations. *Athenians.....than you*—See *Intro.*, para. 42.

Cf. St. Peter's words—St. Peter and the other Apostles were twice imprisoned for boldly preaching the religion of Jesus, but they were delivered miraculously. They continued their preaching with increased boldness; so they were brought before the council of the rulers of the Jews, and the high priest asked them saying, "Did not strictly command you that ye should not teach in this name (of Christ)? And behold ye have filled Jerusalem with your doctrine, and intend to bring this man's (Peter) blood upon us. Then Peter and the other Apostles answered and said, *We ought to obey God rather than men.....* When they heard that they were cut to the heart and took counsel to slay them." But afterwards they were only beaten and were commanded not to speak in the name of Jesus. The Apostles departed, but they ceased not to teach and preach Jesus Christ. *Breath*—Life; vital airs.

Page 58.

As I am wont—As I am in the habit of doing. *Power of mind*—Mental strength or activity. *Making of money*—Earning money. *Disputes*—Contradicts. *Release in.....away*—Let him go away peacefully. *Setting the lower value on*—Undervaluing, *Account*—Consequence or value. *Citizen*—i.e., Athenian. *More nearly...me*—Bound to me in ties of greater relationship than the foreigners. *No better.....God*—You were never more fortunate than now in thus being ministered by me, which I do in obedience to mandates of God. *My service to God*—i.e., my mission of life, by fulfilling which, I serve *Going about*—

Wandering throughout the town. *Persuading*—Convincing. *That*—viz., perfection of your 'souls'. *The mischief is real*—Ironical.

Page 59.

Either acquit.....me—You are at perfect liberty to do anything you like, either to discharge me or not to discharge me. That matters very little. *Way of life*—The particular bent which I have given to my life viz., doing public good by continuing to teach. *No; not if..... time*—No, not even if I were to die many deaths, for thus sticking to the path of my duty. *The request, viz.,* to give me a patient hearing. *Profit*—Do good to. *Who am what.....I am*—Who am a minister of God's wishes in exposing the folly of mankind. *Drive..... exile*—Contrive to have me banished. *Deprive me of*—Disqualify me from enjoying. *Civil rights*—Franchise; rights and privileges of a free citizen, viz., to vote in the Assembly and in other ways to take part in the Government of the State. *'He'* stands for 'Meletus.' *I am.....you*—I am trying to convince you not to commit sin against God, by putting me to death and by disregarding the blessing which God has been pleased to confer upon you (viz., the opportunity of improving your thoughts and morals through my endeavours). *To fill my place*—To occupy my position as a public benefactor. *God has.....long*—See Intro., 34. para. *Quaint*—Queer. *Sluggish..... size*—Idle considering its great size, i.e., as it was noble-looking so it was not active.

Page 60.

Aroused—Awakened from its lethargic habits. *Gad-fly*, an insect which stings cattle and deposits its eggs on the skin. *For I never...point*—For I never desist from vexing them by putting innumerable questions to them at every turn, just as a gad-fly stings an animal and lays eggs upon its body. *Exhorting and reproaching*—

Admonishing and rebuking. *If you...my life*—I advise you as a friend not to put me to death, for your own interest. *Drowsy*—Sleepy. *You are...arouse you*—Just as men feel annoyed when awakened from sleep, so you appear to be vexed being brought to your senses by me; and if you paid heed to Anytus' request, you could easily kill me, and then continue to remain in your ignorance (likened to sleep) throughout your lives, unless and until God were pleased, out of pity for you, to send another wise man to dispel the darkness of your ignorance by the light of wisdom. *God has...city*—i.e., I have been sent by God to the citizens as a gift, in order to look after your interests. *A mere human.....interests*—A mere whim or a sudden impulse of the mind could not have prompted me to devote myself to this work, by making me disregard my own private interests; i.e., had I not been prompted by God with a special inspiration about this matter I would not have devoted myself to this my philanthropic mission, disregarding all my private interests. *By himself*—Individually. *Advantage*—Any pecuniary or some other sort of worldly benefit. *This conduct*—This sort of life. *Without blushing*—Shamelessly. *Effrontery*—Impertinence. *Exact*—Extorted; taken by force. *And I think...poverty*—That I am still a poor man is a conclusive proof of my not being remunerated for my words of instruction.

Page 61.

In private—Privately. *Counsel*—Advice. *Come forward*—Appear. *Take part.....* Councils—Take share in the political deliberations of the Councils of the State.

Divine sign from God—Secret promptings in the shape of an inner voice coming from God. See *Intro.*, page 16. Xenophon personifies this "Divine Sign" as Socrates' Genius, or, Daemon.

Cf. Grote:—

"He had been accustomed constantly to hear even from his childhood, a divine voice; interfering at mo-

ments when he was about to act in the way of restraint but never in the way of instigation. Such prohibitory warning was wont to come upon him very frequently, not merely on great but even on small occasions; intercepting what he was to do or to say. Though later writers speak of this as the *dæmon* or *genius* of Socrates, he himself does not personify it, but treats it merely as a divine sign, prophetic or supernatural voice"—*Hist. of Greece*, Vol VII.

The divinity—The 'demon.' *Caricatured*—Ridiculed (by giving a grossly-distorted picture). *Always turnsact*—Always prevents me from doing something (wrong or inexpedient) which I was on the point of doing, but never actively prompts me to do something positive. This shows the negative character of this divine sign' or Dæmon of Socrates. *I should.....myself*—This refers to the fickleness of the Athenians shown in harassing their best political leaders by trials and punishments either of death or banishment. *And do.....truth*—Because it was a blunt truth that on account of the fickleness of the people, many good men were put to death. Cf., "They have been the destruction of many good men before me, etc." p. 55. Cf., "सत्यं मनीहरी च दुर्लभं वचः" i.e., such a word as is both true and pleasing is very rare. (Truth is often painful). *There is.....time*—In these lines Socrates boldly and openly tells the Athenians in their face that it is on account of the fickleness of their characters—that all real benefactors and reformers amongst themselves can hardly continue to live. *Firmly opposes*—Boldly withstands. *To prevent.....State*—To put a stop to the performance of unjust and unlawful acts in the State. *Would.....justice*—Would sincerely and boldly strive to see justice duly administered. *Make me.....wrong*—Cause or induce me to approve of wrongdoing. *I would.....way*—I would rather accept instantaneous death than submit to the threats or temptations of any man to make me assent to wrongdoing.

Page 62.

Commonplace—A trite or hackneyed subject. *Office*—Public function of the State. See *Intro.*, page 4. *Held*—Filled; occupied. *Rescue their men*—Take care of the wounded who were in the disabled ships (and also accord due funeral rites over the dead).

Battle of Arginusæ—This battle took place in the 26th year of the Peloponnesian War, in which the Athenians won a victory over the Spartans. Callicratidas, the Spartan general perished in this battle (B.C. 406).

Cf. Smith's *Greece*:—

"After a day's debate the question was adjourned, and in the interval the festival of the Apaturia was celebrated, in which according to annual custom, the citizens met together ... Those who had perished at Arginusæ were naturally missed on such an occasion: and the usually cheerful character of the festival was deformed and rendered melancholy by the relatives of the deceased appearing in black clothes and with shaven heads. The passions of the people were violently roused."

In a body—Collectively. *Held the presidency*—Was the *Epistates* See *Intro.*, page 4. and also read the Introduction of the book Page XX. *Clamouring*—Crying vehemently ; making loud complaints. *To face..... justice*—To meet the difficulty with boldness to the end, in order to uphold the cause of justice and law. *Destruction of the democracy*—Subversion of the popular Government of Athens after the battle of Ægospotami, in 405 B.C.

Democracy—A form of Government in which the people possess the sovereign or supreme power.

This sovereign power is exercised differently by different forms of government. Cf. Montesquieu's "Spirit of Laws":—

"A republican form of government is that in which the body or only a part of the people is possessed of the

supreme power. Monarchy, that in which a single person governs by fixed and established laws. A despotic government, that in which a single person directs everything by his own will and caprice."

"When the body of the people is possessed of the *supreme power*, this is called a *democracy*; when the *supreme power* is lodged in the hands of a part of the people, it is then an *aristocracy*. In a democracy, the people are in some respects the sovereign, and in others, the subject."

The Thirty Tyrants—"They (the Thirty) proceeded to exterminate their most obnoxious opponents. But Critias and the more violent party among them still called for more blood. * * * Besides this force (a Spartan garrison), they had an organised band of assassins at their disposal. Blood now flowed on all sides. Many of the leading men of Athens fell, others took to flight. Thus the "Reign of Terror" was completely established" (Smith).

Council Chamber, The Prytaneum.

Leon the Salaminian—Leon, an inhabitant of Salamis. *Wishing to.....crimes*—Wishing to make as many as possible share in the guilt of their crimes. *I do not.....death*—I do not care even a fig (*i.e.*, in the least degree) for death. *Not doing.....man*—This is also Socrates' conception of virtue, *viz.*, consists in the obedience to the laws of God and men.

Page 63.

That government, viz., of the Thirty Tyrants. *With—* In spite of; notwithstanding. *Rule—Reign.* *Very likely—* Most probably. *Should have.....alive*—Should have been spared. *Had held.....so*—Had considered it a supreme duty, as it really is, to uphold the cause of justice honestly. *Yielded.....point*—Submitted even in the slightest degree. *Those whom.....pupils*—Those powerful men whom people falsely call my disciples, *e.g.*, Critias and Alcibiades. So—

ocrates called them his "associates." *Withheld myself*—Kept myself aloof. *While.....mission*—While I was engaged in discharging the duties in connection with my mission, *viz.*, of convincing people of their ignorance. *Alike*—Equally; without any distinction. *Charged*—Held responsible.

Page 64.

Turn out—Become eventually. *Professed*—Pretended. *Any knowledge*—Any branch of knowledge. *Delight in*—Take pleasure in. *Why*—The reason. *That—e.g.*, the exposure of the follies of self-conceited men. (Cf. *Euthyphron*). *In oracles.....man*—Through the medium of oracles, dreams and other things best suited to communicating the wishes of God to man. *Refuted*—Disproved; contradicted. *Deme*—The *demi* in Attica were sub-divisions of the tribes corresponding to the English *townships* or *hundreds*.

Crito—One of Socrates' associates, who attended his master to the end of his life and advised Socrates to take to flight from the prison.

Critobulus—A youth mentioned in Xenophon's "*Banquet*," with whom Socrates held a discussion on *beauty*, was the son of Crito.

Æschynus—In Cary's version the name is spelt as *Æschynes*. He was a disciple of Socrates. He went to Dionysius, the tyrant of Sicily, and afterwards taught philosophy at Athens. Flourished about B.C. 350.

Page 65.

Plato—See Appendix. *Alc, the corruptor, etc.*—Me the so-called corruptor. *Kindred*—Kinsman. *Uncorrupted*—Not taught by me, and so left pure (Ironical). *Might perhaps have some reason, viz.*, shame of publicly declaring their being corrupted by Socrates. *Pretty much*—Tolerably sufficient.

In my defence—In justification of my own conduct. *Less important trial than this*—In a trial which was not so serious and sensational as mine.

Page 66.

To appeal to your feelings—To arouse your tender feelings, viz., pity, sympathy, etc. *Supreme danger*—Greatest danger, because of its involving the chance of the loss of life. *Perhaps.....me*—Perhaps he will feel no compassion for me when he observes that I do not resort to the device of making a touching appeal to the feelings of the judges. *I do not suppose that it is*—I do not assume that it is really the case, i.e., the judges can actually be angry with, and vote against, me, not out of a sense of justice, but of a bias caused by anger. Such a supposition is not at all complimentary to the judges. *In the words of Homer*—To use the language of Homer. *I am not.....woman*—“I too, O best of men, have relatives; for to make use of that saying of Homer, I am not sprung from an oak nor from a rock but from men” (Cary). *Arrogance*—Pride or haughtiness. *I hold you cheap*—Despise you, as men of no worth at all. *Credit*—Reputation. *Made up their minds*—Resolved, concluded.

Page 67.

In a strange way—In a manner not befitting their positions. *Bring discredit on*—Disgrace. *Are no better than women*—As soft-hearted as women are. *Eminent*—Distinguished. *These pitiful pieces of acting, etc.....* quiet—“But you should make this manifest that you will much rather condemn him who introduces these piteous dramas, and make the city ridiculous, than him who quietly awaits your decision” (Cary). *Pitiful pieces of acting*—Theatrical display of words and gesticulations to excite pity or compassion of the judges. *It is our.....reason*—It is our duty not to take an undue advantage over his (the judge's) mind by exciting his pity, but rather to satisfy him by reasonable arguments. *He does.....law*—

The purport is this: The judge sits here to administer justice strictly in accordance with the law, and not being biassed by partiality, for friends or prejudice against foes. He has taken a solemn oath to deal out even-handed justice, and not to favour those who are after his own heart. Friends and foes are to be weighed alike in the balance of justice. The motto of the judge should be "*Fait justitia, ruat cælum*" (Lat.), i. e., Let justice be done, though the heavens fall. *Forswear yourselves*—Swear falsely. *And you ought.....righteously*—You should not permit us to exercise any influence over you, for in that case both you and we would be acting wrongly, you, for not judging strictly according to reason, and we for trying to persuade you to deviate from the path of rectitude. *Require*—Compel. *To do these things*—To have recourse to these artifices for moving your hearts. *More especially.....impiety*—Particularly for the present occasion do not request me to use those tricks which are calculated to secure illegal favour from you, because I am to-day being prosecuted for want of faith in the gods, and if this very day I ask you to swerve from the path of justice by showing me undue favour, and thus to act against the solemn oath taken by you in the name of the gods, my alleged guilt of impiety will be conclusively proved, and this particular act will serve for a satisfactory evidence.

Page 68.

Successful, viz., In moving your hearts. *Prevail on*—Persuade. *Break*—Violate; act against. *I should.....them*—By my attempts at inducing you to break your oaths I should, in a manner, be teaching you to believe that there are no gods, in whose names the oaths were solemnly taken, and thus by my very defence I should be accusing myself of impiety, i. e., of not believing in the gods. *I do believe.....them*—There are two shades of meaning of this sentence. See *Intro.*, text. Pages lxxii-lxxiv. *And to you.....me*—I entirely resign myself to you and to God, confidently believing that my case will be.

decided justly, and in a manner best calculated to secure the *real welfare* of both you and myself.

Though Socrates strenuously asserted that he was not a disbeliever in the existence of God; yet he did, on no occasion whatever; make any definite statement in which he acknowledged the gods of the Athenians, and adopted them as his own.

I do believe...in them.—This sentence has two different shades of meaning, one apparent and the other hidden:—

(1) O Athenians, I tell you emphatically that I believe in the gods with such a degree of earnestness and sincerity as is not to be found in any of my prosecutors.

(2) ...in such a way as is quite unknown to any of my prosecutors; i.e., I believe and accept the gods in a new and different way altogether.

This is a hint to **monotheism** different from the **polytheism** of the Athenians. Socrates' conception of God exactly coincides with that of Plato. According to both, God is all-good, and an embodiment of Truth. From Him evil does not spring. There is no duality in Him for He is one. He never metamorphoses into diverse forms of birds, beasts and monsters, and He never deceives others. In holding this view, Socrates deviated from the current idea of divinity.

Cf. Plato's Republic:—

"God is a Being of perfect simplicity and truth, both in deed and word, and neither changes himself, nor imposes upon others, either by apparitions or by words."

He is found guilty by 281 votes to 220.—According to this statement, Socrates was condemned by a majority of 61 votes, and the total number of dicasts would be 501. Further down, he speaks of the majority of votes as "so narrow," and "if only thirty votes had changed sides, I should have escaped." But in Cary's translation (Bohn's Series), we read:—

"But now, as it seems, if only *three* more votes had changed sides, I should have been acquitted."

The fact is, that the exact number of votes, both against and in favour of Socrates, has not been given either by Xenophon or by Plato. On this disputed point Grote, in his *History of Greece* (Vol. VIII., p. 654) says:—

“ We learn from his own statement in the ‘*Platonic Defence*’ that the verdict of Guilty was only pronounced by a majority of five or six, amidst a body so numerous as an Athenian Dikastery, probably 557 in total number, if a confused statement in Diogenes Laertius can be trusted.” “ Diogenes Laertius said that he was condemned by 281. If Diogenes meant to assert that the verdict was found by a majority of 281 above the acquitting votes, this would be contradicted by the *Platonic Apology*, which assures us beyond any doubt that the majority was not greater than five or six, so that the turning of *three* votes would have altered the verdict. But as the number 281 seems precise, and is not in itself untrustworthy, some commentators, construe it (though the words as they now stand are perplexing) as the aggregate of the majority. Since the *Platonic Apology* proves that it was a majority of five or six, the minority would consequently be 276, and the total 557.” Sir Alexander Grant in his “*Xenophon*” (Ancient Classics Series) says: “As many as 276 of their number were for acquitting him, while 281 voted that he was guilty of the charges brought against him.”

At that—At such a verdict of “guilty.” *And I am not...votes*—This tends to show that the majority was not by 61, as Church makes it, but by far less a number than this, though it might be more than 5 (according to the calculation of the other authorities quoted above). *Thirty votes*—In Cary’s version it stands as “three.” *Had changed sides*—Had been given in my favour. *Have escaped*—Have been acquitted. *To accuse me too*—As joint-prosecutors. *Fifth part, etc., drachmae*—See footnote.

Page 69.

‘*He*’—Meletus, one of the prosecutors.

Counter-penalty—Alternative punishment. "In all cases where the laws had fixed the penalty, one single verdict was thought sufficient; but where the laws were silent, a second was necessary to declare the punishment the offender had incurred. Before this second sentence was pronounced, the judges were ordered to *value* the crime, as Cicero calls it, and the offender himself was asked *What penalty he thought due to it*. And the merits of the case being afterwards debated, the valuation was admitted or rejected, as the judges saw reason; but Socrates incensed them so much with the answer he made them, that they proceeded, without any delay, to pass the second or decretory sentence against him, and he was immediately condemned to suffer death."

Potter's *Grecian Antiquities*.

For having.....ease—For having resolved to spend my life in indefatigable exertions for doing good to others even at the sacrifice of personal comfort. *Value*—Prize; set a high price upon. *Popular oratory*—Public speaking like that of a demagogue. *Appointments*—Offices. *Factions*—Parties. *I was to.....matters*—I was a man of so delicate a conscience that, had I taken any part in such public affairs, I would have offended others by speaking plain and blunt truth, and I would have long perished, having incurred the displeasure of the authorities. *Go*—To take part; engage myself. *Not to think...himself*—Not to devote himself to secure the benefits of the world, until he had taken any care for self-improvement, *i.e.*, for administering to his moral, intellectual, and spiritual needs. *Affairs of Athens* (external)—Political matters of Athens. *Athens herself* (internal)—Real needs of the inner nature of the Athenians themselves (*i.e.*, moral and spiritual culture). *In the same manner—i.e.*, first to provide for the immediate and essential needs, *viz.*, those relating to mind, and then for the remoter and less important matters, *viz.*, worldly concerns. *Then what...life?*—O Athenians, do you like to know what sort of treatment I deserve from you for thus spending my life in giving exhortation

to others? *Suitable reward*—Adequate recompense. *Benefactor* (L. *Bene* good, and *facio*, I do)—One who does good to others. *Wants leisure.....you*—Who needs more time (by being freed from the thoughts of all secular concerns) to be entirely devoted to the discharge of the sacred duties of admonishing you in a more satisfactory way. *Public.....the Prytaneum*—Being supported at public cost at the Prytaneum, the public hall of the Athenians where they offered sacrifices on public occasions, and where the *Prytanes* (Presidents of the Senate) entertained the eminent men of the State and received foreign ambassadors.

Page 70.

Victor at the Olympic Games.—Winner of prizes in the Olympic games. These games were celebrated at Olympia in Elis, and said to have been revived by Iphitus, King of Elis and Lycurgus, the Spartan legislator in 776 B.C. They were open to all the branches of the Greek race. A garland of wild olive was the highest prize awarded. *With his horse or his chariots*—Who has won a horse-race or a chariot-race. At the Olympic games, "there were also horse-races or chariot races; and the chariot-race, with full-grown horses, became one of the most popular and celebrated of all the matches" (Dr. Smith). *Such a man...happy*—An Olympic victor gives you only a *semblance* of happiness by his success at the games, but I give you a *real* happiness by administering to the moral and spiritual needs of your nature. *He is.....am*—Besides the consideration of giving you happiness, I like to urge one thing more, for which I should be preferred to be allowed to live at the *Prytaneum*, viz., that of *want*. The Olympic victor is generally a well-to-do man, and so he needs no public maintenance, whereas I, poor man, really deserve such a help from you. *Stubborn*—Obstinate. *Wronged*—Done wrong or injury to. *Persuade*—Convince. *Only a little time*, i.e., during the short time occupied in holding the trial. *A trial of life and death*—A trial involving so impor

tant questions as those of life and death. *Of it*—Of my innocence. *Clear myself of*—Defend myself against. *Gross calumnies*—Shameful, false and malicious slanders. *"When I am.....penalty*—The purport is contained in the following extract from Xenophon's "*Defence of Socrates*."

"When he was ordered to fix his own penalty he refused to do it; neither would he suffer any other to do it for him; saying that *to fix a penalty implied a confession of guilt*."

Admit—Acknowledge; own. *Evil*—Punishment. *Why should I?*—Through fear of what should I do that? Cf. Cary's version: "Through fear of what? lest I should suffer that which Meletus awards me, of which, I say, I know not whether it be good or evil?" *Lest I...evil?*—Is it for the fear of suffering the penalty which Meletus proposes (viz., death) of which the real nature I am quite ignorant of, i.e., whether it is a blessing or an evil? It should be borne in mind that Socrates did not regard death as an evil, but rather as a blessing (as already said, p. 56, bottom). *Instead of it*—In place of Meletus' penalty, i.e., death. *Rest of my days*—The remaining portion of my life. *The slave...officials*—As a plaything completely at the mercy of the successive officials in charge of the prison-house.

Page 71.

I have no money...with—The construction: I have no money with which to pay a fine. *Exile*—Banishment. *Agree to*—Close with; consent to. *Life would...expect*—Of. Cary's version: "I should indeed be very fond of life, O Athenians, if I were so devoid of reason as not to be able to reflect." *Tolerate*—Endure, permit. *Odious*—Blameable, contemptible. *To be released from them*—To get rid of them. *That is not likely, i.e., "Far from it."* *A fine life* (ironical)—A very miserable life. *For an old man*—In this my old age. *Their elders*—Their guardians or superiors. *For their sakes*—On their account, i.e., for not allowing them to be corrupted by me. *Withdraw*—

Go away. *Hold your peace*—Cesse from annoying others with your cross-examination. *Happen to*—Befall.

Page 72.

An unexamined...living—Death is more acceptable than a state of existence without self-examination, and consequent ignorance of the deep-seated evils of our nature. *I would...pay*—Notice that Socrates does not consider fine a penalty. *Within my means*—Which I am able to pay. *They will...for me*—They will stand guaranteed for the payment of the amount, in case it is not realised from me. *You have...time*—Because I am an old man, would have died a natural death in a short time, had you not condemned me. *As the price...name*—In exchange for the fancied benefit you will have derived from my condemnation, you will gain nothing better than an evil reputation. *Revile*—Calumniate; reproach. *Cast in your teeth*—Lay it at your door; impute it to you. *In the course of nature*—In due and natural order of things. *Near to*—“*being upon*.”

Page 73.

Defeated, i.e., sentenced to death. *I was wanting in*—I lacked; did not possess. *Over-boldness and effrontery*—Audacity and impudence. *Wailing*—Lamentation. *Unworthy of me*—Beneath my dignity. *Maintain*—Am of opinion; hold. *Unmanly*—Improper for a man; cowardly. *Because of...ran*—For the sake of avoiding the danger I was subject to. *I would...live*—I would much rather like to die by defending myself as boldly as I just now did, than to be allowed to live by showing a mean and unmanly behaviour as would be most palatable to you. *May do, i.e., with propriety.* *The pursuer*—The enemy who follows. *Scruple*—Hesitate. *Wickedness...death*—Death cannot overtake a man so easily as wickedness or depravity. *Overtaken*—Caught up.

Page 74.

Slower pursuer, viz., death. *Sentenced*—Condemned,

I shall go.. evil—I shall depart this life being condemned to death by you. O unworthy men, my accusers, but you shall have to leave this world, being overladen with guilt and iniquity for committing this glaring piece of injustice toward me, an innocent man and a sincere benefactor too, and you shall have to suffer the penalty for this inhuman act of yours in the world to be. *Abide by*—Submit to. *Award*—Sentence. *Perhaps...measured*—"These things, perhaps, ought so to be, and I think that they are for the best" (Cary). *Fairly measured*—Justly and equitably dealt out. —*That is the...power*—When a man comes near to the brink of earthly existence, and is about to cross the threshold of eternity through the gates of death, he catches the far-off glimpses of truth of that new life, and is thus inspired with the power of a seer, and can foretell many things more than in other periods of life. Cf.... 'Phædo,' p. 155, the passage where he likens him to the 'swan.' *Be relieved from*—Get rid of. *Call you to account*—Take you to task. *Whom I...see*—Whom I have so long retained, or kept under a check, and so you did not perceive their existence even (*viz.*, my disciples or associates, upon whom "my mantle will fall"). *Harder masters to you*—Severer men who, like task-masters, will demand explanations from you regarding your conduct in life. *For they will be younger...them*—Being raw youths and so impelled very often by their hot blood, they will exasperate you more than I have hitherto done.

Page 75.

Acquitted—Voted for my discharge. *Touching*—Referring to, about, regarding. *Come to pass*—Happened, taken place. *Authorities, i.e.*, the magistrates. *For you.....judges*—I call you judges, because I consider you (*i.e.*, those who voted for his acquittal) worthy of the name, for your having acted in accordance with the law and the dictates of conscience. *The prophetic sign*—See p. 61, and *Notes*, and *Intro.*, page 16. *Wont*—In the habit of. *Opposing*—Dissuading. *Small matters*—Petty

affairs. *A thing...evil*, viz., sentence of death. *Reckoned—Considered.* *Withstand—Oppose.* *Stopped...speaking—* Interrupted me while I am still engaged in speaking. *This thing...me—* This sentence of death which has been passed against me.

Page 76.

Needs— Necessarily (a genitival adverb = of necessity). *Fare—* 'Do' (in the provincial sense), as in 'how do you do?' *To fare well—* To be attended with a fortunate circumstance; to remain in a blissful state. *Reflect—* Ponder. *Wholly ceases...sensation—* Is totally annihilated, and so reduced to a stately utterly devoid of sensation (a sort of mental impression conveyed through the medium of the senses). This state is what is called Nirvana (निर्वाण मोक्ष) by the Buddhists. *Change—* Transformation. *Mig-Pation—* Passage: 'transition.' *A change...place—* Cf. Longfellow:

There is no death ! What seems so is transition;
 'This life of mortal breath
 Is but a suburb of the life Elysian
 Whose portal we call death.—

'Resignation.'

Like the sleep.....gain. This state of "utter forgetfulness," both in a dreamless sleep and in the annihilation of the soul after death, must be considered, if it ever happens at all, very precious for man, and it is only in this blessed moment that it will be possible for him to free himself completely from the trammels of the cares and anxieties of his earthly existence.

Cf. Scott:

"Sleep the sleep that knows no breaking.
 Morn of toil, nor night of waking."

Shakespeare makes his 'Hamlet' say in his well-known soliloquy, that death not followed by horrors is as rare as sleep undisturbed by dreams:—

".....To die, to sleep,—

No more: and by a sleep, to say we end
The heartache, and the thousand natural shocks
That flesh is heir to,—'tis a consummation
Devoutly to be wished. To die, to sleep,—
To sleep ! perchance to dream, ay, there's the rub;
For in that sleep of death what dreams may come
When we have shuffled off this mortal coil
Must give us pause. There's is the respect
That makes clamity of so long life.

Of. Shelly: "How wonderful is Death !

Death and his brother Sleep."

This night—The night in which he sleeps soundly without being disturbed by dreams even. *The great king himself*—The Persian Emperor. He would have very few nights like the one described, for

"Uneasy lies the head that wears the crown."

Shakespeare.

Would find.....count—Because they are so few in number. *Count it a gain*—Consider this seeming loss (i.e., death) a gain. This sentence hears like an echo of St. Paul's words:

"For what things were *gain* to me those I *counted loss* for Christ. Yea doubtless and I *count all things but loss* for the excellence of the knowledge of Christ Jesus, my Lord; for whom I have *suffered the loss* of every thing, and *do count them but dung*, that I may win Christ."—Philippians, iii. 7. 8.

Eternity—That endless or interminable period of man's existence which begins at death. *For them.....night*—I call death a great gain, because when I shall die, my mind will not shrink from fear at the idea of the new eternal existence, but rather it will gladly welcome it, by remembering its previous similar experience, viz., a pleasing foretaste of eternity from the enjoyment of sound sleep undisturbed by dreams in a single night. *Journey*—Migration of the soul.

Page 77.

Other world—Next world, future life. *Be released from*—Get rid of. *Self-styled judges*—Men who having no qualities for impartially administering justice, place themselves in the position of judges; (oppd. to the true judges or demi-gods who in Hades are appointed judges by the gods for their extraordinary sense of justice).

Minos—"A king of Crete, son of Jupiter and Europa, who gave laws to his subjects, B.C. 1406, which still remained in full force in the age of the philosopher Plato. His justice and moderation procured him the appellation of the favourite of the gods, the confidant of Jupiter, the wise legislator, in every city of Greece; and according to the poets he was rewarded for his equity, after death, with the office of supreme and absolute judge in the infernal regions. In this capacity he is represented as sitting in the middle of the shades and holding a sceptre in his hand. The dead plead their different causes before him, and then the impartial judge shakes the fatal urn, which is filled with the destinies of mankind."—

Classical Dictionary.

Rhadamanthus—A son of Jupiter and Europa. He was born in Crete, which he abandoned about the 30th year of his age. He passed into some of the Cyclades, where he reigned with so much justice and impartiality, that the ancients have said he became one of the judges of hell, and that he was employed in the infernal regions in obliging the dead to confess their crimes and in punishing them for their offences. Rhadamanthus reigned not only over some of the Cyclades, but over many of the Greek cities in Asia.—*Classl. Dict.*

Æacus—Son of Jupiter by Ægina, daughter of Asopus, was king of the island of Cænopia, which he called Ægina, after his mother's name. A pestilence having destroyed all his subjects, he entreated Jupiter to re-people his kingdom; and according to his desire all the ants which were in an old oak were changed into men....He was a

man of such integrity that the ancients have made him one of the judges of hell, with Minos and Rhadamanthus.

—*Classl. Dict.*

Triptolemus.—A son of Oceanus and Terra, or according to some, of Trochilus, a priest of Argos. According to the more received opinion he was son of Celeus, King of Attica, by Neræa. He was born at Eleusis in Attica, and was cured in his youth of a severe illness by the care of Ceres, who had been invited to the house of Celeus, by the monarch's children, as she travelled over the country in quest of her daughter. To repay the kindness of Celeus the goddess took particular notice of his son, fed him with her milk, and intending to make him immortal, placed him on burning coals every night: but the mother, who one day watched the process secretly, disturbed the goddess with a sudden shriek. Being thus unable to make him immortal, Ceres taught him agriculture, instructing him how to sow corn and make bread. Triptolemus travelled all over the earth in a chariot drawn by two dragons, given him by the goddess, and distributed corn to all the inhabitants of the world. At his return to Eleusis, he established the Eleusinian festivals and mysteries in honour of the deity. He reigned for some time, and after death received divine honours.—

Adapted from the *Classl. Dict.*

Demi-gods—‘Heroes’ partaking of divine nature. *What would.....with*—“At what price would you not estimate a conference with” (*Cary*).

Orpheus.—A son of Oëger by the muse Calliope. Some suppose him to be a son of Apollo from whom, or (according to some) from Mercury, he received a flute, upon which he played with such a masterly hand that even the most rapid rivers ceased to flow, the savage beasts of the forest forgot their wildness, and the mountains moved to listen to his song. He married Eurydice, with whom he had fallen in love, but the happiness of the loving couple was crossed by the death of Eurydice, caused by the poisonous bite of a serpent, while she was flying from—

DEATH OF SOCRATES.

Aristæus, who, being enamoured of her, was pursuing her. Orpheus maddened with grief desperately entered the infernal regions with his lyre in his hand. Pluto, the King of Hell, and Proserpine the Queen, were moved with his sorrow, and the melody of his strains, and consented to restore him Eurydice on the condition that Orpheus would not look back till he reached the earth. He was just about to place his foot on the earth, when he turned round, and Eurydice vanished from him in an instant. He attempted to follow her, but was refused admission. He totally separated himself from the society of mankind; and the Thracian women, enraged at his coldness to their proposals of love, having torn his body to pieces, threw his head into the Hebrus, which still articulated "Eurydice," as it was carried down the stream into the Ægean Sea. Orpheus, as some report, after death received divine honours, the muses gave an honourable burial to his remains, and his lyre became one of the constellations in the heavens.

Milton mentions this story in:—

"Or bid the soul of Orpheus sing,
Such notes as warbled to the string,
Drew iron tears down Pluto's cheek,
And made Hell grant what love did seek."

Il Penseroso.

"What could the Muse herself that Orpheus bore
The Muse herself, for her enchanting son,
Whom universal nature did lament,
When, by the rout that made the hideous roar,
His gory visage down the stream was sent
Down the swift Hebrus to the Lesbian shore."—
Lycidas.

"That Orpheus self may heave its head
From golden slumber on a bed
Of heaped Elysian flowers, and hear
Such strains as would have won the ear
Of Pluto to have quite set free
His half-regained Eurydice."—

L'Allegro.

Plato evidently believed Orpheus to have been a poet, as he has mentioned his name along with those of the other poets in the same sentence. (1) It was believed, that Orpheus wrote a poetical account of the *Argonautic expedition*; but this is doubted by Aristotle, who says, that there never existed an Orpheus, and ascribes the poem to a Pythagorean philosopher named Cecrops. (2) According to some, the work was the production of the pen of Onomaeritus, a poet who lived in the age of Pisistratus. (3) Pausanius and Didorus Siculus, however, speak of Orpheus as a great poet and musician.

Musæus—An ancient Greek poet, supposed to have been son or disciple of Linus or Orpheus, and to have lived about 1,410 years before the Christian era. None of the poet's compositions are extant."

Hesiod—An ancient Greek poet, the date of whose works is uncertain; some placing them before, and others after Homer. His works are, "*The Works and Days*," "*Theogony*" (an account of the ancient mythology) and "*The Shield of Hercules*."

Homer—The most ancient and celebrated of the Greek poets, but of whose birthplace, station in life, and actual existence, the most diverse opinions are held by the learned of modern days. According to the generally-accepted tradition, he was born in Smyrna, and having conceived the idea of the *Iliad*, he travelled in order to gain knowledge of men, and localities for his great work. In his old age he became blind, and was compelled to earn his bread by wandering from city to city reciting his verses. Homer's greatest works are two epic poems, the "*Iliad*" and the "*Odyssey*." After his death, seven different cities claimed the honour of being the birthplace of Homer. So runs the complement:—

"Seven rival cities contend for Homer dead
Through which the living Homer begged his bread."

Palamedes—was a Grecian chief, son of Nauplius, King of Eubœa by Clymene. When the Grecian kings

were to go to the siege of Troy, Ulysses, to save himself from going, counterfeited madness; which Palamedes, suspecting, ordered they should lay Ulysses' son, Telemachus, in the furrow where the father was ploughing with an ox and an ass, and sowing salt. Ulysses immediately stayed the plough to save his child. This being discovered, he was compelled to go to the wars. For this, Ulysses hated Palamedes and tried his best to distress him; and when all his expectations were frustrated he had the meanness to bribe one of his servants and to make him dig a hole in his master's tent and there conceal a large sum of money. After this Ulysses forged a letter in Phrygian characters, supposed to have been written to Palamedes by King Priam, requesting him to deliver into his hands the Grecian army, according to the conditions previously agreed upon when he received the money. This forged letter was carried by means of Ulysses, before the princes of the Grecian army. Palamedes was summoned, and he made solemn protestations of his innocence. But all was in vain; the money that was discovered in his tent served only to corroborate the accusation, and he was found guilty by all the army, and stoned to death.....Palamedes was a learned man as well as a soldier, and according to some he completed the alphabet of Cadmus, by the addition of four letters, during the Trojan War. To him also is attributed the invention of dice and backgammon, and it is said that he was the first who regularly ranged an army in a line of battle and who placed sentinels round a camp, and excited their vigilance and attention by giving them a watchword.—

Adapted from the Classl. Dict.

“**Ajax**—The son of Telamon by Peribœa or Eriboœa, was next to Achilles, the bravest of all the Greeks in the Trojan War. After the death of Achilles, Ajax and Ulysses disputed their claim to the arms of the dead hero. When they were given to the latter, Ajax was so enraged that he slaughtered a whole flock of sheep, supposing them to be the sons of Atreus, who had given the preference to

Ulysses, and stabbed himself with his sword. Some say that he was killed by Paris in battle, others that he was murdered by Ulysses."

Shirley, in his "*Ajax and Ulysses*," represents him as a "mere bulk without brains:"

"And now I look on Ajax Telamon
I may compare him to some spacious building;
His body holds vast rooms of entertainment,
And lower parts maintain the offices;
Only the garret, his exalted head,
Useless for wise receipts, is filled with lumber."

This is a parallel of the character of *Bhima* in the *Mahābhārata*.

The leader of the great expedition against Troy—Agamemnon (see p. 55), King Mycenæ, and Argos, was brother to Menelaus. Agamemnon married Clytemnestra, and Menelaus, Helen, both daughters of Tyndarus, King of Sparta, who assisted them to recover their father's kingdom. After the banishment of the usurper, Agamemnon established himself at Mycenæ, whilst Menelaus succeeded his father-in-law at Sparta. When Helen was stolen by Paris, Agamemnon was elected commander-in-chief of the Grecian forces going against Troy. The fleet was detained at Aulis, where Agamemnon sacrificed his daughter, Iphigenia, to appease Diana. During the war he showed much valour, but his quarrel with Achilles was fatal to the Greeks. On his return home he was killed by his wife, Clytemnestra.

Odysseus (the Greek form of the name of *Ulysses*) was a king of Ithaca, and son of Anticlea and —A stroke of an unfavourable planet; hence, a sudden misfortune or calamity.

Laertes, or according to some, of Sisyphus (see *Palamedes*). During the Trojan War the King of Ithaca was courted for his superior prudence and sagacity. He was not less distinguished for his activity, eloquence and valour. After the Trojan War, Ulysses embarked on board ship to return to Greece, but he was exposed to a number of misfortunes before he reached his native country. These

adventures form the subject matter of Homer's *Odyssey*. On his return home he was successful in killing a host of suitors of Penelope, his wife, and re-established himself on the throne. He was killed by Telegonus, his son, by the magician Circe, who had landed in Ithaca, with the hope of making himself known to his father.

Coleridge sketches his character admirably in these lines: ".....Ulysses in the *Odyssey* shines by his own light, moves by his own strength, and demolishes all obstacles by his own arm and his own wit. He receives no luster from mere contrast; we admire his force, not his success; his battle, not victory; his heroism and not his triumph alone; we refer others to him, but himself to no other."

Sisyphus, the son of Æolus and Enaretta, was the most crafty prince of the heroic age. He built Ephyre, afterwards called Corinth. It is reported that Sisyphus, mistrusting Antolycus, who stole the neighbouring flocks, marked his bulls under the feet, and when they had been carried away he confounded the thief by selecting from his numerous flocks those bulls which, by the mark, he knew to be his own...After his death, Sisyphus was condemned in hell to roll to the top of a hill a large stone, which had no sooner reached the summit than it fell back into the plain with impetuosity and rendered his punishment eternal. The causes of this rigorous sentence are variously reported.

Cf. 'Odyssey' (Pope's translation), Bk. XI:—

"I turn'd my eye, and as I turn'd surveyed
A mournful vision ! the Sisyphian shade.
With many a weary step, and many a groan,
Up the high hill he heaves a huge round stone ;
The huge round stone, resulting with a bound,
Thunders impetuous down, and smokes along the ground—
Again the restless orb his toil renews
Dust mounts in clouds, the sweat descends in dews."

Assuredly—Undoubtedly. 'That,' i.e., cross-examination (because there is justice in the conduct of those heroes).
Face—Meet. Good—Great.

Page 78.

Fortunes—Concerns. *Not by chance*—Not accidentally, but by the will of God. *So far...them*—"In this they deserve to be blamed" (*Cary*).

Visit...punishment—Inflict punishment upon them. *Before*—In preference to. *Something*—Men of some consequence. *Nothing*—Men of no importance or weight. *Desert*—That which is deserved; reward or punishment merited. *At your hands*—From you.

CRITO.

Crito was one of those friends of Socrates who had been present at his trial and offered to assist in paying a fine, had a fine been imposed, instead of the sentence of death. He wrote several dialogues, which are now lost.

This hour—This early hour. *Let you in*—Admit you. *Besides...service*—"He is under some obligation to me." *I wish that...sorrowful*—"I should not myself like to be so long awake and in such affliction. *Sweetly*—Peacefully. *Purposely*—Intentionally.

For I...repose—"That you might pass your time as pleasantly as possible." *Temper*—Disposition. *Happy*—Cool (*i.e.*, not easily agitated), *Calmly*—Meekly. *That has come to you*—That has befallen or overtaken you.

Page 82.

It would die—"It would be disconsolant for a man at my time of life to repine because he must needs die."—Notice that Socrates was at that time 70 years old. *Other men...fate*—"But others, Socrates, at your age, have been involved in similar calamities, yet their age has not hindered their repining at their present fortune."

Bitter news—Sad tidings. *Has the ship come from Delos?*—See *Phædo*, p. 105. The ship that was sent to the island of Delos by the Athenians every year in memory of Theseus' victory over the Minotaur.

Theseus, son of Ægeus, King of Athens, went, to Crete, expecting to deliver Athens from the frightful tribute imposed upon it by Minos for the murder of his son. This consisted of seven youths and seven maidens whom the Athenians were compelled to send every year to Crete, there to be devoured by the Minotaur, a monster with a human body and a bull's head, which Minos kept concealed in a labyrinth. Theseus, being highly enraged at this horrible practice, offered on the third occasion to go with the chosen maidens and youths, hoping to put an end for ever to the horrible tribute. He was successful in killing the monster, and coming out of the labyrinth with the help of Ariadne, Minos' daughter, who being enamoured of him, gave him a sword to kill the monster with, and a clue of thread with which to trace his way out. Theseus sailed away from Crete with Ariadne and the innocent youthful victims who were likewise saved. When Theseus was on the point of setting out for Crete, he made a vow that if he returned victorious, he would yearly visit in a solemn manner the temple of Apollo in Delos. The ship, the same which carried Theseus, and had been carefully preserved by the Athenians, was called *Theoria* and *Delias*. When the ship was ready for the voyage, the priest of Apollo solemnly adorned the stern with garlands, and a universal instruction was made all over the city.....When the ship arrived at Delos, they offered solemn sacrifices to the god of island, and celebrated a festival in his honour. After this they retired to their ship, and sailed back to Athens, where all the people of the city ran in crowds to meet them.

Capital punishment forbidden. During this festival it was not lawful to put to death any malefactor, and on that account the life of Socrates was prolonged for 30 days (*Adapted from Lempriere.*).

Sunium, a promontory at the southern extremity of Attica in Greece, "about 45 miles distant," as Lempriere says, from the Piræus, the harbour of Athens. There was there a small harbour, as also a town. Minerva had there a beautiful temple, whence she was called *Sunias*. There are still extant some ruins of this temple.

Clear—Obvious. May it end fortunately—I wish that I may die peacefully and happily. The authorities, viz., The Eleven, who were entrusted with the duty of executing the penalties of the criminals. Judge—Conjecture. So it seems...wake me—“And you seem very opportunely to have refrained from waking me.”

•Page 83.

Comely—Handsome.

Phthia, a town of Phthiotis (Achaia), at the east of Mt. Othrys in Thessaly, where Achilles was born, and from which he is often called *Phthius heros*.

'The third day hence shalt thou fair Phthia reach—

This is an adaptation of a part of Achilles' speech in reply to the requests made by the members of a deputation that waited upon him in order to soothe his wrath against Agamemnon when he ceased to take part in the war (Trojan), and when the Greeks were defeated by Hector, the Trojan prince. In Pope's version it stands thus:—

"Then shall you see our parting vessels crown'd
And hear with ears the Hellespont resound.
The third day hence shall Phthia greet our sails
If mighty Neptune send propitious gales.
Phthia to her Achilles shall restore
The wealth he left for this detested shore."

The Iliad IX, ll. 471—73, 75, 76.

This fancied declaration of the woman in the dream seemed to foreshadow Socrates' death on the third day from that time. The dream was thus interpreted by Socrates. Achilles, hopeful declaration of reaching his home and native city on the third day after sailing from Troy seemed to symbolise Socrates' going to the other world (which is man's real and eternal home) on the third day from that time. Phthia, in both the cases symbolised home—the temporary home of Achilles on earth, and the eternal home of Socrates in the other world.

Will be more...disaster—Will be equivalent to many misfortunes befalling me all at once.

Disaster—This word owes its origin to the old astrological belief that human destinies were greatly influenced by the heavenly bodies. (*Dis* and Gr. *aster*, star), (Lit.)—A stroke of an unfavourable planet; hence, a sudden misfortune or calamity.

Not only shall...again—"Besides being deprived of such a friend as I shall never meet with again." *Caring more...friends*—"To value one's riches more than one's friends." *The world...escape*—"For the generality of men will not be persuaded that you were unwilling to depart hence, when we urged you to it."

Care so much about...world?—Attach so much importance to the opinion of the many? *The best...did*—"For the most worthy men, whom we ought rather to regard,

will think that matters have transpired as they really have."

This very thing...you—This very circumstance of your being sentenced to death.

Page 84.

Falsely accused—Calumniated.

I wish that.....random—"Would, O Crito, that the multitude could effect the greatest good, for then it would be well. But now they can do neither: for they can neither make a man wise nor foolish; but they do whatever chances."

At random—At hap-hazard; not systematically.

Informer—Dr. Ogilvie says: "One who communicates to a magistrate a knowledge of the violation of law; one who gains his livelihood by informing against others." (This word is always used in a bad sense, and it must not be confounded with *informant*, which is used in a good sense).

Stole you away—Secretly carried you off. *Dismiss it*—Banish from your mind any such fancied cause of apprehension. *Bound*—Under a moral obligation. *Run those risks*—Hazard such chances of danger. *About much besides*—"About many other things." *On that score*—On that account; for that. *Cheaply bought*—Bribed with a trifling sum of money. *To spend much upon them*—To spend a large amount of money in order to win them over to our side.

My fortune is at your service—I lay all my wealth at your disposal to be spent for your good in any way you like. *Feeling*—Scruple; hesitation. *Strangers*—Foreigners (i.e., those Greeks who were not Athenians).

Page 85.

Stand in your way—Cary has, "give you any trouble," i.e., prove an obstacle to your going. *Welcomed*—Cordially received.

Thessaly, or "Thessalia, a country of Greece, whose boundaries have been different at different periods. It was generally divided into four separate provinces. The name *Thessaly* is derived from *Thessalus*, one of its monarchs. Its mountains and cities are celebrated, such as Olympus, Pelion, Ossa, etc....The inhabitants of the country passed for a treacherous nation, so that false money was called *Thessalian coin*, and a perfidious action *Thessalian deceit*"... (From Lempriere).

Make much of you—"Esteem you very highly" (Cary). *Abandon your life*—"Give yourself up." *Playing the game of your enemies*—"Pressing on the very results with respect to yourself which your enemies would press (Cary), i.e., acting in such a way as to fulfil the wishes of your enemies.

To take their chance in life—To be prosperous or unfortunate in their worldly careers according to the freaks of "fickle chance," for want of proper guidance and training in their early lives. *The usual fate of children, etc., viz., extremely miserable life.*

Beget—Generate. *You are choosing the easy way*—You are preferring an indifferent, and easy-going sort of life led by those who are not bold enough to live piously by confronting the difficulties of the world.

Set upon—Attach to. *Virtue*—Mark Crito's or rather Plato's conception of *virtue*, which consists in boldly meeting the temptations and trials of the world.

Cf. Milton's conception of Virtue:—

"I cannot praise a fugitive and cloistered virtue, unexercised and unbreathed, that never sallies out and seeks her adversary, but slinks out of the race, where that immortal garland is to be run for, not without dust and heat. That Virtue therefore which is but a youngling in the contemplation of evil, and knows not the utmost that Vice promises to her followers, and rejects it, is but a blank virtue not a pure."—*Areopagitica*.

Refer to page 125 (*Phaedo*)—"Shadow of virtue...no freedom, etc." Cf. also *Kalidasa*—

विकारहेतौ सति विक्रियते

येषां न चेत्तासि तै एव धैराः ।

That is to say, those only are truly pious and self-governed who remain unmoved even amidst the temptations of the world, and whose hearts are not contaminated by them,

Here Crito rebukes Socrates by saying that throughout his life Socrates talked much of virtue, but when a trial came, he was not bold enough to meet it, and come out of it victorious.

Page 86.

The crowning absurdity...affairs—"A ridiculous consummation of the whole business." *Shirked....cowardice*—Avoided the difficulty by reason of extreme timidity and indolence. *If we had...all*—Had we been persons of the least degree of worth or manliness at all.

Evil—Misfortune. *Dishonourable*—Disgraceful. *We are lost*—We are undone, i.e., no further hope remains. *Valuable*—Commendable. *A man.....truest*—"A person who will obey nothing within me but reason, according as it appears to me, on mature deliberation, to be best."

Cast aside—Reject. *They seem to me..to*—"They appear to me in much the same light, and I respect and honour them (those arguments) as before. *Scare*—Frighten.

Page 87.

Hobgoblins—Frightful apparitions. *Examine the question*—Decide or settle the disputed point. *Go back to*—Recur to. *Used we to be right*—Were we justified? *Talking at random*—Talking irrelevantly or unreasonably.

Arguing for the sake of argument—Adducing reasons, for their own sakes, i.e., for defeating our antagonists in discussion and not for proving a disputed question, with their help. *It was...nonsense*—"It was merely jest and trifling" (Cory). *Whether...or not*—Whether it will appear to me in a different light now that I am in this condition or the same."

Set it aside—Give it up ; reject it. *Yield assent to it*—Consent to it or, accept it as true. *We ought to... others*—“Of the opinions which men entertain, some should be very highly esteemed and others not.”—“*Highly*,” is to be taken as modifying “esteem,” and not “form”

For you, humanly...circumstance—“For you, in all human probability, are out of all danger of dying to-morrow, and the present calamity will not lead your judgment astray.” *Humanly speaking*—“In all human probability” i.e., so far as we can guess with our limited foresight. *Biassed*—Prejudiced.

Page 88.

A man who is in training—“A man who practises gymnastic exercises” (Cary).

Who is earnest about it—Who devotes himself, life and soul, to the gymnastic exercises. *Trainer*—“Teacher of the exercises.” *Who understands the matter*—Who is an expert in the matter. (Cf. a similar argument used in the *Apology*, p. 49). *That is disabled*—The body is impaired, in case of disobedience to the instructions of the gymnastic master.

Page 89.

For if we.....wrong—Cary translates the passage thus: “And if we do not obey him, shall we not corrupt and injure that part of ourselves which becomes better by justice, and is ruined by injustice?” *Cripple and maim*—Disable and impair, i.e., corrupt or debase (in the moral sense). *That part of us, viz., the soul*. *Health*—“What is wholesome.” *Crippled*—Impaired. *Of less consequence*—Less important.

Page 90

We must...Truth herself will say of us—We need not mind the opinion of the people at large on our own conduct, because they do not know how to distinguish right from

wrong; but on the contrary, we should regard the opinion of that man who knows what right is, and if possible, of truth herself, *i. e.*, we should depend upon our own moral judgments and uncompromising truth. *You are mistaken to begin with*—"At first you did not set out with a right principle"

The conclusion, former times—That is to say, the principle which we had laid down in former discussions, that no regard is to be had to popular opinion is still found to hold good. *Hold to*—Firmly adhere to. *Starting from these premises*—"From what has been admitted," *i. e.*, taking these propositions as true.

Premises—"In logic, the two first propositions of a syllogism, from which the inference or conclusion is drawn" (*Webster*). *We will let it alone*—"We will give it up," *i. e.*, abandon the idea altogether of escaping from the prison.

Are only the...thought—"Considerations like these in reality belong to these multitudes, who rashly put one to death, and would restore one to life, if they could do so without any reason at all."

Are only the reflections of our friends the many—Owe their existence to the influence of the multitude. *Friends*—Used ironically. *Lightly*—Without sufficient reason; inconsiderately.

Page. 91

Which is our guide—Which enables us to distinguish the right from the wrong. *Take our respective parts in my escape*—Contribute the several shares of help of each of us to the act of effecting my escape.

Must not take any account—Must not pay heed to the considerations. *Contradict*—Controvert; object to. *I will be convinced, i. e.*, "I will yield to you." *Do not go on repeating to me*—"Cease to urge upon me the same thing so often."

To act with your approval—To act in such a way as to gain your approbation. *Ought we never...others?*—"Say we, then, that we should on no account deliberately commit injustice, or may we commit injustice under certain circumstances, under others not?" *Conclusions*—Decisions.

Page 92.

As—Although. *In days gone by*—In former times. *Gravely*—Seriously. *That we children*—That we in no respect differed from children, *i. e.*, were as foolish as children. *Most assuredly*—Beyond all question. *The world*—The multitude. *Shame*—Disgrace. *Whether we...death*—"Whether we must suffer a more severe or a milder punishment than this."

Ought we repay...may?—Is it right on our part to return an injury for one received, as the multitude think? *And is it...evil?*—Ought we to inflict any injury upon the man from whom we have received one?

No matter—Never minding. *And in conceding.....mean*—"But take care, Crito, that in allowing these things you do not allow them contrary to your opinion." *Conceding*—Admitting, allowing.

Page 93.

Have no common ground of argument, i. e., differ widely from one another in their reasonings. *They can...belief*—Because they can never agree they needs must hate each other's opinion. *Share my opinion*—Be of the same opinion with me.

Dissent—Differ. *Hold to*—Adhere to. *Ought a man.....of them?*—"Say, whether when a man has promised to do things that are just, he ought to do them, or evade his promise?"

Just agreements—Just promises, or those that we agreed on as being just. *Shuffle out of them*—Evade them. *Abiding by*—Acting in accordance with. *Commonwealth* (Lit.)—The common good or happiness; hence

the form of government supposed best to secure the public good; a republic; a free or popular government.

Page 94.

If that it.....escape—“Or by whatever name we should call it.” *What have...do ?—*What do you intend to do? “What do you purpose doing?”

*But—Except. So far as in you lies—*As far you are able. - *Overthrown—*Subverted. *Decisions—*Judgments. *Have no force—*Are ineffectual; are annulled. *Set at naught—*Defied. A State can.....individuals—The substance of the argument is this: Although he may have received a wrong treatment from the State, yet it will be unjust on his part to return the same to it, by disregarding the “conjoined wills” of the Athenians. Implicit obedience to such a decision will be returning good for evil and will be equivalent to a due performance of his duty. If he evades the penalty he will be the greatest enemy to the State of which he forms a component part or unit. The State will thus be undermined and afterwards materially injured, if the units (i.e., the individual citizens themselves) be thus disinclined to obey the laws of the State which are their own making, and are based upon a universal mutual consent or contract amongst themselves for mutual preservation. This idea will be clear, if the theory of the origin of laws from the primitive condition of man be here explained.

Cf. Baron de Montesquien's “Spirit of Law.”

“As soon as mankind enter into a state of society, they lose the sense of their weakness; equality ceases, and then commences the state of war. Each particular society begins to feel its strength, whence arises a state of war betwixt different nations. The individuals likewise of each society become sensible of their force; hence the principal advantages of this society they endeavour to convert to their own emolument, which constitutes a state of war betwixt individuals. These two different kinds of states give rise to human laws. The different nations of this earth have laws relative to their mutual intercourse, which is, what we call, the *Law of Nations*. As members of a society that must be properly supported, they have laws relative to the governors and the governed; and this we distinguish by the name of *Politic Law*. They have also another sort of laws, as they stand in relation to each other; by which is under-

stood the *Civil Law* Besides the *Law of Nations* relating to all societies there is a polity or civil constitution for each, particularly considered. No society can subsist without a form of government. The united strength of individuals constitutes what we call the **body politic**. The strength of individuals cannot be united without a conjunction of all their wills. The conjunction of those wills is what we call the **Civil State**. *Bk. I. Chs. II, III.*

Orator, a public speaker (who acted as an advocate; in ancient times, for clients in the courts of justice).

In defence of—In favour of. *Which makes...supreme*—Which enjoins that judgments passed by the courts of justice must be enforced at any cost. *Cause*—Case. *The State*—The Commonwealth.

Destroy us—Make us ineffectual, by disregarding us. *Took your mother*—Married your mother. *Begat*—Procreated. *Tell us, have you...marriage*—"Say, then, do you find fault with those laws amongst us that relate to marriage as being bad?" *Nurture*—Act of nourishing.

The substance of so many arguments may be summed up in the following lines:—

Good and loyal citizens must make certain concessions and compromises by partly giving up their own private interests, according, to *variable* degrees and circumstances, in order to adapt themselves to the state (whole) of which they are individual members (component parts). It is a bounden duty of the individual members of the State to abide by its rules or laws, otherwise the State cannot exist as a homogeneous whole, it being the product of the conjoined wills and united strength of the individual.

A good citizen is an individual member of the State, who is willing to submit to its laws and decisions, injurious though they may be to his own private interests.

By so long living in the State Socrates had practically given his tacit consent to submit to its laws, and to be directed in all the affairs of his life by the decisions passed by it (State).

He has been enjoying all the benefits arising therefrom, which are so essential to the peacefulness of domestic life of the individual, and to which his birth and education can properly be ascribed. His very birth is the result of the laws of the State, and he has been, since his boyhood entirely under their sway, and owes a great deal to them, so he is in duty bound to comply with all their commands, without questioning their propriety. He has consented to abide by the laws, his consent having been given tacitly, by his living so long in the State. Now that he is, aged seventy years, he has had ample time to consider whether he should have obeyed the laws of the State or not. Had he decided otherwise, he might have gone away from his own State. Since he has not done that,

and lived so long in the State with apparent contentment and happiness—like the other Athenians, it is implied that he had agreed to submit to the laws of the realm. He openly refused to propose banishment as his alternative penalty on set purpose, showing thereby that he was ready to abide by the *conjoined decision* of the Athenians, 'even at the greatest sacrifice possible for man on earth, viz., the loss of one's life. It is therefore unjust for him to try to save his life by escape from the prison.

Page 95.

You were brought into the world—You were made to be born. *In the first place*—In the first instance; first of all. *Child*—Offspring. *Fathers*—Ancestors. *Do you think... ours?*—"Do you think that there are equal rights between us?"

Are on a level with ours—Are on the same footing with our rights. *Do you.....anything to you*—"And whatever we attempt to do to you, do you think you may justly do to us in turn?" *To answer.....reviled you*—"To retort when found fault with."

Reviled—Reproached. *You, the...virtue?*—"You who, in reality, make virtue your chief object."

Are you too wise to see?—"Are you so wise as not to know?" *Worthier*—"More honourable." *More august*—More awe-inspiring. *Held in higher honour*—"Is more highly prized." *Men of understanding*—Men possessed of right judgment; sensible men.

Bounden duty—Imperative or obligatory duty, as distinguished from *discretionary* duty. (The word was originally a participle, but is now used only as an adjective). *Persuade* (here)—To influence by entreaty or argument.

Page 96.

In silence—Quietly, without murmur or complaint. *If it orders.....imprisonment*—"If it bids one suffer, whether to be beaten or put in bonds." *Give way*—Fail in discharging your duty. *Desert your post, i.e.,* abandon or give up performing the duties entrusted to you. *Convince*—Persuade

The Law of God—Austin thus defines it:—

“The Divine laws or the laws of God are laws set by God to his human creatures...As distinguished from duties imposed by human laws, duties imposed by the Divine laws may be called *religious duties*. Violations of religious duties are styled *sins*...Of the divine laws or the laws of God, some are *revealed* or promulgated, others *unrevealed*” (*Lectures on Jurisprudence*).

To use violence—To use physical force, *i.e.*, by striking blows or assaulting. **To use violence to your country**—To inflict injury upon your country by infringing its laws. **If we are right in saying**—Whether we say truly. **Brought you into the world**—“Gave you birth” (*Cary*) **We gave you...could**—We imparted to you and all other citizens all the good in our power.

Proclaim—Declare publicly. **Whithersoever**—To whatever place. **To avail himself of it**—To turn it to account; to make use of it. **He has reached man's estate**—He has attained majority; he has come of age.

Stands in his way—Obstructs or opposes him. **Athenian colony**—A country or city planted by a body of the Athenians far away from Athens, which was called *metropolis*, or parent city, in relation to the land colonised.

“A Greek Colony was always considered politically independent of the mother-city and emancipated from its control. The only connection between them was one of filial affection and of common religious ties” (*Smith's Greece*).

Page 97.

Administer—Dealt out, distribute; dispense. **Has agreed**—Has in fact entered into a compact with us. **Does a threefold wrong**—“Is in three respects guilty of injustice.” **Who are his parents, *i.e.*, who have given him his being.** **After he has agreed to obey us**—Having made a compact that he would obey us.

Sternly—Rigidly. **Alternative**—“A choice of two things, so that if one is taken, the other must be left” (*Webster*).

Expose yourself—Make yourself liable or subject. *If you do what you intend*—If you accomplish your design, i.e., if you evade your punishment. *And why?*—For what reason shall I expose myself to those charges much more than other Athenians? *Retort with justice*—Reply justly. *I have bound...them*—I have entered into a compact with them. *The festivals*—The national festivals like those of Eleusis, Delos, Samothrace, Olympia, etc.

Isthmian Games—Sacred games among the Greeks, which derived their names from the Isthmus of Corinth, where they were held. These games were said originally to have been instituted in B. C. 1326 by Sisyphus, in honour of Melicertes, who was changed into a sea-deity when his mother Ino had thrown herself into the sea with him in her arms. Their original mode of celebration partook, as Plutarch remarks, more of the character of mysteries than of a great and national assembly with its various amusements. Subsequent to the age of Theseus, these games were celebrated as a national festival in honour of Poseidon (Neptune); and this innovation was ascribed to Theseus himself, who, according to some legends, was a son of Poseidon. The celebration was conducted by the Corinthians, but Theseus had reserved for his Athenians some honourable distinctions. These games were observed every third, or rather fifth year, and held so sacred and inviolable that even a public calamity could not prevent the celebration. The games and contests were the same as those at Olympia, and embraced wrestling, the pancration and horse and chariot racing. Musical and poetical contests were likewise carried on. The prize of a victor in these games consisted at first of a garland of pine-leaves, and afterwards of a wreath of ivy; but in the end the ivy was again superseded by a pine-garland (*Adapted from Lempriere and Dr. Smith*).

Except on Military Service—Socrates served as a common soldier at the siege of *Potidea*, between B. C. 432-429; at the battle of *Delium* in 424 B. C., and at the battle of *Amphipolis* in 422 B. C. (see *Intro.*, page. 2).

You had no...laws—Travelling was “considered an important part of the education of the wise men of those days, Nearly all the philosophers, historians and law-givers of antiquity travelled extensively. (See Plato's life, Appendix). Plato himself travelled into many countries after the death of Socrates. Solon, the great legislator of Athens, travelled through many parts of Greece, Asia and Egypt, and studying the laws of the different nations he introduced some of them into his own system.

Cf. “One of his (of Amasis, King of Egypt) law was that every man should appear once a year before the governor of his department, and prove, on pain of death, that he was getting an honest livelihood. Herodotus (who also travelled extensively) says that Solon borrowed this law from the Egyptians, and that it was in force at Athens up to his own days (*Swayne's Herodotus*).

Contented—Satisfied.

Page 98.

Have offered to go into exile—Have proposed banishment as the counter-penalty or alternative punishment. (Apology, p. 69, Notes).

Could have.....consent—Could have gone into exile with the express permission of the State. Without it—Without the consent of the State. - But then you glorieddie—“Then indeed you boasted yourself as not being grieved if you must needs die.”

Those words—“Those professions.” You are actinggovernment—You are acting as the vilest slave would act, by endeavouring to make your escape contrary to the conventions and the compacts by which you engaged to submit to our government.”

Not in mere words, but in reality—“In deed, though not in word ;” practically, though not expressly by words of promise Admit—Acknowledge. Breaking—Violating ; acting against. .

And you not breaking.....hurry—“What else, then, are you doing but violating the conventions and compacts which you made with us, though you did not enter into

them from compulsion, or through deception, or from being compelled to determine in a short time?" (*Cary*).

Led—Induced. *To make up your mind*—To arrive at a final decision.

Lacedæmon—"A noble city of Peloponnesus, the capital of Laconia, called also *Sparta*, and now known by the name of *Misitra*....." (*Lempriere*).

"Crete—Now *Candia* one of the largest islands of the Mediterranean Sea at the south of all the Cyclades. It was once famous for its 100 cities, and for the laws which the wisdom of Minos established there. (*Notes on the Apology*, p. 29). The inhabitants have been detested for their unnatural loves, their falsehood, their piracies and robberies. Jupiter, as some authors report, was educated in that island by the Corybantes, and the Cretans boasted that they could show his tomb....." (*Lempriere*).

They were well-governed. Notice that Socrates was not favourably disposed towards the *democratical mode of government* of Athens, and admired the *oligarchies* or *limited monarchies* of other cities, as those of Sparta, Crete, Thebes, Megara, etc. He was an advocate of an *aristocracy of intellect*.

The Hellenes—The Greeks.

"The name of Greece was not used by the inhabitants of the country. They called their land *Hellas* and themselves *Hellenes*. At first the word *Hellas* signified only a small district in Thessaly, from which the *Hellenes* gradually spread over the whole country. The names of *Greece* and *Greeks* come to us from the Romans, who gave the name of *Græcia* to the country, and of *Græci* to the inhabitants." (*Dr. Smith*).

Page 99.

The Barbarians—All non-Hellenic people, *i.e.*, all the nations of the then-known world who were not Greeks; (*Lit.*) "*The unintelligible folk*," because the Greeks could not understand their tongue.

Cf. They all described men and cities that were not Grecian by the term *Barbarian*...The Greeks applied this word indiscriminately to every foreigner, to the civilized inhabitants of Egypt and Persia, as well as to the rude tribes of Scythia and Gaul" (*Dr. Smith*).

You went away....cripple—"But you have been less out of Athens than the lame and the blind and other maimed persons." *Went away from*—Went out of. *Transgressing and breaking*—Infringing and violating.

Tolerably certain—Pretty clear or sure. *They*—Your friends. *Of exile*—Of being themselves banished." *Of losing their civil rights*—Of being deprived of the rights of citizenship," or of *franchise*. *Of forfeiting their property*—Of having their property confiscated by the State.

Thebes—A celebrated city, the capital of Bœotia. The manner of its foundation is not precisely known. Cadmus is supposed to have first begun to found it by building the citadel *Cadmea*...The Thebans were looked upon as an indolent and sluggish nation, and the words of *Theban pig* became proverbial to express a man remarkable for stupidity and inattention. There was another Thebes which was the capital of Thebais, a country in the southern part of Egypt. There were some other towns of the same name in Thessaly, Phthiotis, etc. But the epithet "neighbouring" signifies that the Thebes mentioned here and elsewhere in these dialogues, is the one of Bœotia, of which the supposed founder was Cadmus. Simmias and Cebes were natives of this Thebes, and not of the Egyptian town of the same name.

Megara—A city of Achaia, the capital of a country called Megaris, founded about 1131 B.C. It is situated nearly at an equal distance from Corinth and Athens."

Who care for their city—"Who have any regard for their country. *Will look askance at you*—Will look obliquely at you with contempt and suspicion.

You will confirm the judges—You will consolidate or strengthen the opinion of the judges that you were really guilty of corrupting the youth. *Verdict*—Sentence, viz. of capital punishment for the charges brought against you e.g., corrupting the youth, etc. *Just*—Well-merited.

Who is a subverter—Who overthrows; who violates *The thoughtless*—"Weak-minded men." *Will life.....do?*—And should you do so (i.e., avoid well-governed cities), will it be worth your while to live?

Consort with—Keep company with; mix. *Converse without shame*—And have the effrontery to talk. *Institutions*—

Permanent rules of conduct or of government which are enjoined by authority

Page 100.

For there is most disorder and license—Because in Thessaly the greatest irregularities and lawlessness prevail. (For the moral character of the people of Thessaly refer to the *Note on Thessaly* in p. 80). *License*—"Liberty abused or used in contempt of law and decorum" (*Webster*).

Liberty must be distinguished from *license*

Cf. Milton:—

"*License* they mean when they cry *Liberty*;

For who loves that must first be wise and good."

Dressed up, i.e., disguised. "Clung so greedily to life— Were attached so fondly to life; were so fondly desirous of living. *Transgress the highest laws—* Violate the most sacred laws. *If you do not displease them—* "Should you not offend any one." *Much that will make you blush—* "Many things utterly unworthy of you." *Entertainment—* Feast, banquet *Will you take.....too?—* "Will you take them to Thessaly, and there rear and educate them, making them aliens to their country, that they may owe you this obligation too?"

Page 101.

Make a journey to Hades— Go to the other world; *i.e.,* die. *That, viz., your children will not be taken care of by your friends if you die. Are good for anything at all—* Are capable of rendering you the least benefit.

Advised— Persuaded. *Fostered—* Nurtured. *Before justice—* In preference to justice. *The rulers who sit in judgment there—* Those who act as judges in Hades."

Cf. "The true judges, who are said to sit in judgment below, such as Minos and Rhadamanthus and Aeacus, and Triptolemus and the other demi-gods who were just in their lives" *The Apology*, page 77).

In this shameful way—So disgracefully. *Wronged*—Unjustly condemned. *Not by us.....by men*—Not on account of any inherent defect in ourselves (the laws), but for the worthlessness of those who acted as judges.

Cybele—A goddess, daughter of Cœlus and Terra, and wife of Saturn. She is supposed to be the same as Ceres, Rhea, Vesta, etc. All the mythologists are unanimous in mentioning the amours of Cybele and Atys, a beautiful youth whom her father mutilated. In Phrygia the festivals of Cybele were observed with the greatest solemnity. Her priests, called Corybantes, Galli, etc., were not admitted into the service of the goddess without a previous mutilation. In the celebration of the festivals they imitated the manners of mad men, and filled the air with dreadful shrieks and howlings, mixed with the confused noise of drums, tabrets, bucklers, and spars. This was in commemoration of the sorrow of Cybele for the loss of her favourite Atys. ...From Phrygia the worship of Cybele passed into Greece, and was solemnly established at Eleusis, under the name of Eleusinian mysteries of Ceres.

The Worshippers of Cybele. The Corybantes. Frenzy—Excitement. *This is what.....words*—Just as the Corybantes in their mood of religious excitement seemed to hear no other sound than that of flutes during the celebration of the solemnities of their mysteries, so I seem to hear no other sound than that of these words; i.e., my mind is so completely and so powerfully convinced of the truth of this opinion that it is useless for any one to try to change it with arguments of ordinary force. *Drowns all other words*—Overpowers all other arguments; i.e., makes me incapable of being convinced by any other reasonings.

Page 102.

Succeed—i.e., in making me believe otherwise. *Nevertheless*—However. *Say on—Go on speaking*; continue to speak. *Let us do as I say*,—i.e., Let us pursue this course.

THE PHÆDO.

(The conclusion only).

In order that the student may enter into the spirit of what Socrates says at the end of this famous dialogue (on the immortality of the soul) the student is invited to read the summary of the *Phædo* as given in the Introduction.

A man of sense—a reasonable man. *Insist*—"Affirm positively."

Page 207.

Seeing that—Since. *That it is...belief*—"This appears to me most fitting to be believed and worthy the hazard for one who trusts in its reality." *The venture...these*—"For the hazard is noble, and it is right to allure ourselves with such things as with enchantments." *Prolonging*—Lengthening. *For these reasons...calls him*—"On account of these things, then, a man ought to be confident about his soul, who, during this life, has disregarded all the pleasures and ornaments of the body, as foreign from his nature, and who, having thought that they do more harm than good, has zealously applied himself to the acquirement of knowledge, and who having adorned his soul not with a foreign but its own proper ornament, temperance, justice, fortitude, freedom, and truth, thus waits for his passage to Hades, as one who is ready to depart whenever destiny shall summon him." *Set forth*—Start for the other world (*i. e.*, depart this life). *A tragic poet*—A writer of tragedy, like Æschylus. *Fate calls*—Destiny summons. *How shall we serve you best*—In what way "can we most oblige you?"

Page 208.

Take care of yourselves—Always administer to the needs of your soul, without caring to enjoy the pleasures of the body. *And you...do*—If you thus go on improving yourselves, morally and spiritually, you will do, by that

very act, the highest good to me and to my family, and to yourselves. *Are careless of your own selves*—Neglect to improve your souls. *Not follow the...times*—"Not live as it were in the footsteps of what has been now and formerly said." *Profuse*—Abundant. *Will be of no avail*—"Will do no good at all." *Only you...you*—Do so much first as only to ascertain exactly what my *self* consists in, either in my soul or in my body. First catch me, and do not let me escape from you, then judge whether you will have to bury me or to do anything else with me. This is meant as a *gentle* rebuke to Crito for his ignorance betrayed in still confounding the body with the *real self* of man. Had he not still entertained that false impression, he would not have asked whether he was to be buried or not. The real *he* (*i. e.*, the soul) would no longer remain in the body after his death; so the friends of Socrates were at liberty to do anything they liked with his body (a mass of matter only), and Socrates was not prepared to dictate anything about that, because he did not consider his body as his real self. *Arranges in order*—"Methodizes each part of the discourse." *Go away to the.....blessed*—"Depart to some happy state of the blessed." *Comfort*—Console. *Have.....away on him*—Have produced no effect upon his mind in convincing him of the immortality of the soul. *Do you.....different way*—Be ye then my sureties to Crito in an obligation contrary to that which he made to the judges, *i. e.*, I request you to stand guarantees with him for the fact that I shall not certainly remain with my body after my death, but shall go away, just in same manner as he stood with the judges about my not running away without paying the penalty. *Then he will feel.....less*—That he may be less afflicted for me after my death.

Page 209.

To use words..... soul—The purport is this: Knowledge is virtue. The medium of imparting and receiving knowledge is *language*. If language is clothed in confused, misleading and unintelligible words, then knowledge is

not properly communicated or acquired; so virtue becomes defective; and therefore the wrong use of words creates an evil in the soul. Grito just now used a word wrongly, *i.e.*, he used the word *body* in the sense of the real *self* of man, *i.e.*, soul. *Of good cheer*—Cheerful. *Dwelling on*—Dealing with; discussing or speaking about. *One grown-up son*—Lunprocles.

The Eleven—A body of officers who carried in to execution the penal sentence of the law of Athens. An inferior officer directly serving under these was called **The servant of the "eleven."**

Page 210.

Try to.....can—Try to endure what is inevitable as easily as possible. *Courteous*—Polite. *Has been...of men*—Proved the worthiest of men. *Heartily*—To their hearts' content. *But my own.....spent*—"Except to become ridiculous to myself in being so fond of life, and sparing of it when none any longer remains."

Page 211.

Made a sign to—Nodded to. *Standing by*—Standing near. *You understand these things*—You are especially skilled in these matters. *Until...heavy*—Until there is a heaviness in your legs. *It will act of itself*—"It will do its purpose." *Handed*—Held out to. *Without.....feature*—Without betraying any sign of fear or weakness by turning pale or by distorting any of his limbs. *With that fixed glance of his*—Steadfastly looking at the man, as was his wont. *Draught*—Potion (any quantity of liquid to be quaffed or drawn at once). *Libation*—Act of pouring any liquid, usually wine, either on the ground, or on a victim in sacrifice, in honour of some deity. *Prosperous*—"Happy." *Be it so*—So may it be. *Fairly well*—Tolerably well, but with great difficulty. *My tears.....myself*—I could not but shed tears, notwithstanding my strongest efforts at restraining them. *A loud cry, etc.*—An agony of grief (by bitterly weeping and lamenting).

Page 212.

Break down—To be overpowered. *Made us.....down*—Pierced the heart of every one present. *That they might... way*—Cary gives a milder form of translation: "That they might not commit any folly of this kind." *Calm.....up*—Be quiet and endure. *Bear up*—Keep up your courage. *Lay down on his back*—Lay supine; i.e., with his back on the ground and face upwards. *Felt himself*—Touched himself. *From time to time*—Now and then. *Groin*—The depressed part of the human body between the belly and the thigh. *Uncovered his face*—Opened the covering of his face.

Asclepius, son of Apollo by Coronis, or as some say, by Larissa, was god of medicine. Asclepius was physician to the Argonauts, and considered so skilled in the medicinal power of plants, that he was called inventor as well as the god of medicine. He restored many to life, of which Plato complained to Jupiter, who struck Asclepius with thunder, but Apollo, angry at the death of his son, killed the Cyclops, who made the thunderbolts. Asclepius received divine honours after death. Goats, bulls, tams and pigs were sacrificed on his altars, and the cock and serpent were sacred to him (see the footnote in the Text-book)

(Adapted from Lempriere).

It shall be done—'Shall' here indicates promise. *Movement*—Convulsive movement.

APPENDIX.

MODEL QUESTIONS WITH ANSWERS OR HINTS TO ANSWERS.

1. *Name and sketch the lives of the two great reliable authorities on the life and teachings of Socrates.*

Ans. The two great reliable authorities on Socrates' life are (a) Xenophon and (b) Plato.

(a) **Life of Xenophon.** Xenophon was a celebrated Athenian general, philosopher, and historian, who at an early age became the disciple of Socrates, with whom he was a great favourite. In 401 B.C., he joined the Greeks in the pay of Cyrus, and accompanied him in his expedition against his brother Artaxerxes, King of Persia. After the battle between the two brothers, at Cunaxa, in which Cyrus was slain, the Ten Thousand Greeks made a memorable retreat, principally under the leadership of Xenophon from Babylonia in the Euxine, and thence to Chrysopolis, opposite Byzantium. He afterwards assisted Seuthes, King of Thrace, in regaining his kingdom, and next reconducted the Greeks into Asia, where they joined the Spartan general, Timbron, against Tissaphernes and Pharnabazus. In 396 B.C. Xenophon accompanied Agesilaus, King of Sparta, in his Asiatic expedition. After 394 B.C. he settled at Scillus, near Olympia, where he composed almost all his works, of which the chief are:—*The Memorabilia of Socrates, Anabasis, Hellenica, Cyropædia, Symposium*, and several other minor works on various subjects. His style is so chaste and elegant that Xenophon has been termed the "Attic Bee." Born about 431 B.C., died about 359 B.C.

(b) **Life of Plato.** Plato was an illustrious Greek philosopher. His father was Ariston, and on his mother's side he was descended from Solon. After receiving training in gymnastics, Plato applied to the study of music and poetry; and composed some pieces intended for Olympic exercises; but on hearing Socrates deliver a long discourse,

he burnt them and became his disciple. He was a disciple of Socrates for about ten years, and upon his death, in 399 B.C., Plato left Athens and travelled into different countries in search of knowledge. At Cyrene he studied geometry and other branches of mathematics; thence he went into Egypt, where, during 13 years, he sought to learn all that the priests could teach him. He next visited Italy and settled at Tarentum. Having made a voyage to Sicily, he became acquainted with Dionysius, tyrant of Syracuse, whom he unfortunately offended, and who induced the Spartan ambassador, in whose vessel Plato was returning home, to sell him for a slave at Ægina; but his purchaser having given him freedom, he repaired to Athens, where he commenced teaching in the garden of the Academy, whence his philosophy was called the *Academic*. After making two other voyages to Sicily, he settled in his native city, and there spent the remaining years of his life in literary and philosophical pursuits. Born at Athens, B.C. 429, and died 347 B.C.

2. *Compare and contrast the workmanship of Plato with that of Xenophon, as exhibited in delineating the personality of Socrates.*

(a) *Ans.* Both Xenophon and Plato wrote dialogues, with Socrates as their chief spokesman. Xenophon is wanting in dramatic power. So the matter of the dialogues is only given, but the delicacy of their form, marked by a good-humoured irony, is lost. Xenophon is not therefore successful in bringing before us the distinctive personality of Socrates, whereas Plato, in his philosophical dialogues, is perfectly successful in setting forth his delicate, intellectual turns and his famous *Irony*, which consisted in a sort of mock deference, always in good taste to the person to be instructed. Xenophon, with his quick and impatient soldier's mind, could not at all appreciate these traits of Socrates' character, (b) It is from Plato that we learn that Socrates was one of the politest gentlemen that ever lived, never wounding the feelings of others, always sympathetic, and giving instructions under the

forms of good-breeding; whereas Xenophon gives an account of Socrates, which does not fully suggest this idea. (c) Xenophon records dry but solid facts about Socrates, and so gives the lie to the belief of the cities that the Socrates of philosophy is a mere creation of the genius of Plato.

3. Write a short sketch of Socrates' life (Introduction).

4. Cite instances of Socrates' heroism endurance and moral courage (Introduction, page 3).

5. Give a brief description of the period in which Socrates flourished, noticing all the forces of the environment that moulded and developed his intellectual constitution (Introduction, page 1).

Note also the following passage about the great Age of Pericles of Athens: The Greek literature, before the 5th century, B.C., was Hellenic, but during this century, it became more and more exclusively Athenian. During this period almost every branch of literature was cultivated at Athens to a much greater extent than in all the rest of Greece: the drama was peculiarly her own; oratory was nowhere so powerful as in the Pnyx; the Attic prose style was a model for every Greek writer; philosophy, whether native or foreign, flourished only by the banks of the Ilissus; and in every sense, Athens was the Prytaneum of Greek wisdom, where the central fire blazed on its altar, ministering, however, light and warmth to all the lands of Greece (*Abridged from Muller and Donaldson*).

6. Who was the author of the "Clouds"? With what object was the "Clouds" written? What effect did it produce upon the minds of the people? How far was it well-merited? Give a brief argument of the comedy, making necessary quotations. What definite historical fact does it disclose?

Hints to answer (Introduction, page 3). Aristophanes, the author of the *Clouds*, was an admirer of the good old days of Athens and the primeval simplicity of the Athenians. So naturally he hated the growing spirit of philoso-

phical enquiry of his time. The *Clouds* is an expression to this personal hatred of Aristophanes, and the violence of the popular feeling against Socrates. The object of the book was to discredit and so to check the dawning spirit of philosophical criticism. *Note the following extract:* "The chief notoriety of this piece is derived from its being considered, by Plutarch, as the immediate cause of the trial and death of Socrates.....Nothing indeed can exceed the ludicrous figure which Socrates cuts in this play: the poet at one time introduces him hoisted up (as Ben Jonson expresses it) with a pulley and made to play the philosopher in a basket; to measure how many feet a flea could skip geometrically by a just scale, and edify the people from the engine." Socrates himself, according to Ælian, was present in the theatre during the whole of the performance, and boldly stood up in view of the audience during the representation. Notwithstanding this magnanimous conduct the theatre rang with plaudits, and the philosopher was but the more conspicuous object of the insults of an infuriated rabble" *Abridged from "The History of Greek Literature" by Talfourd and others).*

7. *It is said that Socrates was twice married. Who were the two wives? Give an account of the controversy about the marriage of Socrates.*

8. *Give a short account of the Sophists, and draw a contrast between them and Socrates (Intro., page 5).*

9. *What was the range of Socrates' knowledge? (Intro., page 2. What was his attitude towards the study of natural sciences?*

10. *What was, according to Socrates, the proper study of mankind? What was the nature of philosophy before the time of Socrates? Compare and contrast the philosophical position of Socrates with that of the Pre-Socratic philosophers and of the Sophists.*

Hints—Socrates' idea of the proper study of man may be summed up in the well-known couplet of Pope:—

"Know then thyself, presume not God to scan,
The proper study of mankind is man."

Philosophy with the Pre-Socratic philosophers was nothing more than a rude kind of Physics and Metaphysics. Philosophical study, properly so-called, consisting in the study of *man*, both as an individual and a member of the State, was commenced since the time of the Sophists and of Socrates (see *Introduction*, page 5).

11. *How far was Socrates original in the framing of Definitions and the Inductive Method of logical enquiry? With what modern philosopher can he be compared in this respect?*

Hints—See *Introduction*, page 8. Quote Aristotle's passage. Read also the following extract from Grote's *History of Greece*. Vol. VIII, pp. 617-20: "The conversations of Socrates exhibit the main features of a genuine inductive method, struggling against the deep-laying, but unheeded, errors of the early intellect acting by itself without conscious march or scientific guidance—upon which Bacon so emphatically dwells. Amidst abundance of *instantia negativa*, the scientific value of which is dwelt upon in the *Novum Organon*—and negative instances too so dexterously chosen as generally to show the way to new truth, in place of that error which they set aside—there is a close pressure on the hearer's mind to keep it in the distinct track of particulars, as conditions of every just and consistent generalisation.....I know nothing so clearly illustrating both the subjects and the method chosen by Socrates as various passages of the immortal criticisms in the *Novum Organon*. When Socrates devoted his time to questioning others "What is piety?" What is justice? What is temperance, courage, political government?" etc., we best understand the spirit of his procedure by comparing the sentence which Bacon pronounces upon *the first notions of the intellect as radically vicious, confused, badly abstracted from things, and needing complete re-examination and revision*, without which, he says, not one of them could be trusted.Many passages might be extracted from the *Novum Organon* that afford a clear illustration and an interesting

parallel to the spirit and purpose of Socrates. He sought to test the fundamental notions and generalisations respecting man and society, in the same spirit in which Bacon approached those of physics: he suspected the unconscious process of the growing intellect, and desired to revise it, by comparison with particulars, and from particulars too, the most clear and certain, but which from being of vulgar occurrence, were least attended to. And that which Socrates described in his language as "conceit of knowledge without the reality" is identical with what Bacon designates as the *primary notions*—the *puerile notions*—the *aberrations*—of the intellect left to itself, which have become so familiar and appear so certainly known that the mind cannot shake them off, and has lost all habit, we might almost say all power, of examining them. The stringent process of the Socratic Elenchus, afforded the best means of resuscitating this lost power. And the manner in which Plato speaks of the cross-examining Elenchus, as "the great and sovereign purification, without which every man, be he the Great King himself, is unschooled, dirty, and full of uncleanness in respect to the main conditions of happiness," precisely corresponds to that "*cross-examination of human reason in its native or spontaneous process*," which Bacon specifies as one of the three things essential to the expurgation of the intellect, so as to qualify it for the attainment of truth."

12. Give a picture of Socrates as drawn by Plato in his "Symposium" (Introduction, page 5).

13. What circumstance did serve to give a start to the public career of Socrates as a Reformer? Can you assign any date to this event? (Introduction, pages 4, 5).

14. (a) What were Socrates' aim and conception of Reform?

Hints—(Intro., "Socrates a Reformer of words and thoughts," page 8).

(b) What was the method adopted by Socrates in carrying out his object? Cite or refer to passages in Plato's dialogues illustrative of your answer (Introduction, page 9).

15. Give a brief account of the philosophical system of Socrates and criticize it. Explain in this connection: "*His object was to impart not any positive system, but a frame of mind.*"

Hints—(Intro., pages 8-10).

16. Grote says: "*Socrates was positive and practical in his end—negative only in his means.*" Explain the full significance of this statement.

Ans. If the philosophers of the New Academy considered Socrates either as a sceptic or as a partisan of systematic negation, they misinterpreted his character, and mistook the first stage of this process—that which Plato, Bacon, and Herschel call the purification of the intellect—for the ultimate goal. The *Elenchus*, as Socrates used it, was animated by the truest spirit of *positive science*, and formed an indispensable precursor to its attainment. There are two points, and two points only, in topics concerning man and society, with regard to which Socrates is a sceptic, or rather, which he denies and on the negation of which his whole method and purpose turn. He denies (1) first, that men can know that on which they have bestowed no conscious effort, no deliberate pains, no systematic study, in learning; (2) he denies, next, that men can practise what they do not know; that they can be just or temperate or virtuous generally, without knowing what justice or temperance or virtue is. To imprint upon the minds of his hearers his own negative conviction on these two points is, indeed, his first object and the primary purpose of his multifarious dialectical manœuvring. But though *negative in his means*, Socrates is *strictly positive in his ends*: his attack is undertaken only with distinct view to a positive result; in order to shame them out of the illusion of knowledge, and to spur them on and arm them for the acquisition of real, assured, comprehensive, self-explanatory, knowledge—as the condition and guarantee of virtuous practice. Socrates was, indeed, the reverse of a sceptic: no man ever looked upon life with a more positive and practical eye: no man ever pursued his mark with a

clearer perception of the road which he was travelling; no man ever combined in like manner the absorbing enthusiasm of a missionary, with the acuteness, the originality, the inventive resource, and the generalising comprehension of a philosopher (Grote's *History of Greece*, Vol. VIII).

17. *What is meant by the principles of seeing "the One in the Many, and the Many in the One?" How far are these principles employed in the Platonic dialogues?*

Ans. The principles here meant are those of *synthesis* and *analysis* or *generalisation* and *classification* or *definition* and *division* which form the foundation of all the systems of logic. Both in the dialogues of search and in those of exposition, the process of *generalisation* is kept in view and brought into conscious notice, directly or indirectly. The relation of the universal to its particulars, the contrast of the constant and essential with the variable and accidental, are turned and returned in a thousand different ways. The principles of *classification*, with the breaking-down of an extensive genus into species and sub-species, form the special subject of illustration in two of the most elaborate Platonic dialogues, and are often partially applied in the rest. To see *the One in the Many* and *the Many in the One* is represented as the great aim and characteristic attribute of the real philosopher. The testing of general terms and of abstractions already embodied in familiar language, by interrogations applying them to many concrete and particular cases, is one manifestation of the Socratic cross-examining process, which Plato multiplies and diversifies without limit. It is in his writings and in the conversations of Socrates that general terms and propositions first become the subject of conscious attention and analysis; and Plato was well aware that he was here opening the new road towards formal logic, unknown to his predecessors, unfamiliar even to his contemporaries Grote—*Plato and the other companions of Socrates*, Vol. I).

18. *What do you understand by the "irony" of Socrates? Describe the effect it produced upon those it was directed against. Cite illustrative passages from the Platonic dialogues (Introduction, page 10).*

Hints—The *irony* of Socrates consisted in a sort of mock deference, always in good taste, to those whom he was going to instruct. Grote says: What is termed "*his irony*," or assumption of the character of an ignorant learner asking information from one who knew better than himself, while it was essential as an excuse for his practice as a questioner, contributed to add zest and novelty to his conversation; and totally banished from it both didactic pedantry and seeming bias as an advocate; which, to one who talked so much, was of no small advantage.....The effect was enhanced by a voice and manner highly plausible and captivating, and to a certain extent, by the very eccentricity of his Silenic physiognomy.....After he had acquired celebrity, this uniform profession of ignorance in debate was usually construed as mere affectation, and those who merely heard him occasionally, without penetrating into his intimacy, often suspected that he was amusing himself with ingenious paradox" (*History of Greece*, Vol. III).

19. *Explain fully what is meant by "Knowledge is Virtue."*

Hints—This question is in continuation of question 156. Grote says: "Socrates resolved all virtue into knowledge or wisdom; all vice into ignorance or folly. To do right was the only way to impart happiness, or the least degree of unhappiness compatible with any given situation. Now this was precisely what everyone wished for and aimed at, only that many persons, from ignorance took the wrong road; and no man was wise enough always to take the right. But as no man was willingly his own enemy, so no man ever did wrong willingly; it was because he was not fully or correctly informed of the consequences of his own actions: so that the proper remedy to apply was *enlarged teaching of consequences and improved judgment*. To make him willing to be taught, the only condition required was to make him conscious of his own ignorance; the want of which consciousness was the real cause both of indocility and of vice.....He had present to his mind, as the grand depravation of the human being, not so much vice as

madness; that state in which a man does not know what he is doing.....The mad man is incapable of any of the duties incumbent on social man, nor can he, even if he wishes, do good either to himself or to others.....Madness was ignorance at its extreme pitch, accompanied too by the circumstance that the mad man himself was unconscious of his own ignorance, acting under a sincere persuasion that he knew what he was doing. But short of his extremity there were many varieties and gradations in the scale of ignorance which, if accompanied by false conceit of knowledge, differed from madness only in degree.....The worst of all ignorance—that which stood nearest to madness—was when a man was ignorant of himself, fancying that he knew what he did not really know, and that he could do or avoid or endure what was quite beyond his capacity (*History of Greece*, Vol. VIII). Compare also *Meno*: “Socrates proceeds to prove that virtue is knowledge or a mode of knowledge. Virtue is good: all good things are profitable. But none of the things accounted good are profitable unless they be rightly employed; that is, employed with knowledge or intelligence. This is true not only of health, wealth, beauty, etc., but also of the mental attributes—justice, moderation, courage, quick apprehension, etc. All of these are profitable, and therefore good, if brought into action, under knowledge or right intelligence; none of them are profitable or good without this condition—which is therefore the distinctive constituent of virtue” (Grote—*Plato and other Companions of Socrates*).

20. *Characterise the originality of Socrates.*

Ans. Socrates, the *parens philosophice*, the first of Ethical philosophers, was the man who opened to Science both new matter, alike copious and valuable, and a new method, memorable not less for its originality and efficacy, than for the profound philosophical basis on which it rests. Though Greece produced great poets, orators, speculative philosophers, historians etc., yet other countries, having the benefit of Grecian literature to begin with, have nearly equalled her

in all these lines, and surpassed her in some. But where are we to look for a parallel to Socrates either in or out of the Grecian world? The cross-examining *Elenchus*, which he not only first struck out, but wielded with such matchless effect and to such noble purposes, has been mute ever since his conversation in the prison; for even his great successor, Plato, was a writer and lecturer, not a colloquial dialectician. No man has ever been found strong enough to bend his bow, much less sure enough to use it as he did. His life remains as the only evidence, but a very satisfactory evidence, of how much can be done by this sort of intelligent interrogation: how powerful is the interest which it can be made to inspire: how energetic the stimulus which it can apply in awakening dormant reason and generating new mental power (*Grote—History of Greece*).

THE APOLOGY.

21. *What was the immediate cause of Socrates' indictment? What were the charges brought against him? What was the remote cause of the unpopularity of Socrates?*

Ans. Socrates was thought to fill the mind of youth with newfangled ideas, and to teach boys to lose respect for their own fathers, substituting a preposterous independence of spirit for the obedience natural to their age. In the year 399 B.C., when Socrates had for at least thirty years pursued his mission, and when he was more than seventy years of age, the feeling of unpopularity which he had excited found its culmination, owing apparently to the circumstance that he had endeavoured to prevent the son of one Anytus, a rich tradesman and powerful demagogue, from following his father's trade as a leather-seller. The boy appears to have been full of promise, and Socrates wished him to choose a more intellectual career. Anytus, however, was incensed, and took counsel on the matter with others who bore grudge against Soc-

one day there appeared, in regular form, posted up at the office of the King Archon, one of the chief civil magistrates at Athens, an indictment signed with the names of Meletus, Antus and Iycon, in the following terms: "*Socrates is guilty of crime, first, in not believing in the gods that the city believes in; secondly, in introducing other new gods; thirdly, in corrupting the youth. The penalty due is—death*" (Grant's *Xenophon*).

For "the remote cause of his unpopularity" see *Introduction*, page 16, under "*The real cause of his unpopularity.*"

22. Describe briefly the trial and defence of Socrates at the court of justice. What was the procedure of trial prevalent in the Athenian law-courts? (*Introduction*, page 13).

23. How far does the "*Apology*" contain any of the actual utterances of Socrates? What can be said about the composition of this piece? (*Introduction*, pages 14, 15).

24. Mr. Riddel says: "*The 'Apology' is artistic to the core, and full of subtle rhetoric.*" Justify the remarks by referring to passages illustrative of your answer. (*Introduction*, page 15)

25. Unfold all the points of excellence of the "*Apology.*" (*Introduction*, page 15).

26. What were Socrates' political opinions? Explain the full significance of the statement: "*All popular government was obviously incompatible with his whole intellectual position.*" (*Introduction*, under "*Socrates on the Democracy of Athens,*" pages 15, 16).

27. What was Socrates' standard of morality?

What is the point of disagreement between Plato and Xenophon in this respect, (*Introduction*, under "*Socrates' Morality,*" page 8).

28. (a) Give a short account of Socrates' religious belief, mentioning the special source of inspiration which he claimed (*Introduction*, pages 16, 17). (b) What do

you know of the "Divine sign" of Socrates? In what light has this been represented by the other Greek writers and modern critics? To what mental phenomenon does it actually correspond? Show that it was not conscience (Introduction, page 16, 17).

Hints to the answer of (a)—*Socrates' religion, tending towards "Monotheism."* In the *Timæus* and *Philebus*, abstract goodness is merged in the concrete God. But even here his conception of Deity rises far above the jealous and sensitive occupants of Homer's Olympus, who were immortal beings with mortal passions and sympathies strongly attached to persons and places, and sharing in all the hopes and fears of their worshippers. A Christian writer could hardly frame a more exalted idea of divinity than that which Plato has expressed in many of his dialogues. With him the deity is a being of perfect wisdom and goodness, all-wise and all-powerful, ruling the world which he has created by the supremacy of His reason. He can be only known to us through some type or form; but let none suppose that He would put on a human shape by night or by day, to help a friend or deceive a foe; for, being perfect goodness in himself, such a change could be only for the worse; and being perfect truth He hates a lie either in word or in deed. In this conception of the Deity, Plato does but represent the tendency of Greek religion towards "Monotheism." Long before his time, all the deeper thinkers had ceased to believe in the old mythology (For details see the original, Collins' "*Plato*"—*Ancient Classics series*, pages 172-79). Read also the note on "I do believe in the gods.....them, *Apology*, page 68.

The Platonic Trinity was "The Good, the Beautiful and the True." Of सत्यं शिवं सुन्दरम् ।

THE CRITO.

29. (a) Give a short sketch of the "Crito." Was the incident recorded in this Dialogue real? (b) "It has been remarked by Stallbaum that Plato had a twofold design in this dialogue. What are these two designs?"

Hints to (a)—Introduction, pages 17, 18.

Ans. to (b)—The two designs meant by Stallbaum are the following: (1) The Primary object of this dialogue was to free Socrates from the imputation of having attempted to corrupt the Athenian youth. (2) The other was to establish the principle that under all circumstances it is the duty of a good citizen to obey the laws of his country. Hence the other title of this dialogue is "The duty of a Citizen." *Note*—These two points, however, are so closely interwoven with each other, that the general principle appears only to be illustrated by the example of Socrates.

30. (a) Give a summary of the harangue supposed to be addressed by the Laws of Athens to Socrates, demanding from him implicit obedience. (b) What was the purpose of Plato in this pleading?

Hints to (a)—See detailed Summary of the "Crito" as given in the author's "Socrates," *His Life and Teaching*, pages 34, 35, under the supposed remonstrance of the Laws Athens.

Ans. to (b)—This striking discourse appears...intended by Plato...to set forth the personal character and dispositions of Socrates in a light different from that which they present in the *Apology*. In defending himself before the Dikasts, Socrates had exalted himself into a position which would undoubtedly be construed by his auditors as disobedience and defiance to the city and its institutions. This dialogue, puts into the mouth of Socrates a rhetorical harangue, forcible and impressive, which he supposes himself to hear from personified Nomos or Atens, claiming for herself and her laws plenary and unmeasured obedience from all her citizens, as a covenant

due to her from each.....Socrates is thus made to express the feelings and repeat the language of a devoted democratical patriot. His doctrine is one which every Athenian audience would warmly applaud, whether heard from speakers in the assembly, from litigants in the *Dikastery*, or from dramatists in the theatre.....It may be considered as almost an Athenian commonplace. Hence it is all the better fitted for Plato's purpose of restoring Socrates to harmony with his fellow-citizens. It serves as his protestation of allegiance to Athens, in reply to the adverse impressions prevalent against him.....He is thus presented as a citizen not merely of ordinary loyalty, but of extraordinary patriotism (*Grote—Plato and the other companions of Socrates*, Vol. I.).

31. *Does the political opinion recorded in the Crito as attributed to Socrates harmonise with the one which is universally accepted as held by him? If there be any contradiction, how can it be reconciled?*

Ans. - In trying to bring back Socrates within the pale of democratical citizenship and to exculpate him from the charge of incivism, Plato overlooks the marked specialities of Socrates' character. When we read the language of Socrates, both in the *Apology* and in the *Gorgias*, we find a very different picture given of the relations between him and Athens. We find him there presented as an isolated and eccentric individual, a dissenter, not only departing altogether from the character and purposes general among his fellow-citizens, but also certain to incur dangerous antipathy, in so far as he publicly proclaimed what he was. The *Kriton* (*Crito*) takes him up as having become a victim to such antipathy; yet as reconciling himself with the laws by voluntarily accepting the sentence.....It is the compromise of his long-standing dissent with the reigning orthodoxy, just before his death (*Reconciliation*). Still, however, though adopting the democratical vein of sentiment for this purpose, Socrates is made to adopt it on a ground peculiar to himself. His individuality is thus upheld. He holds the sentence

pronounced against him to have been unjust, but he renounces all use of that plea, because the sentence has been legally pronounced by the judicial authority of the city and because he has entered into a covenant with the city. He entertains the firm conviction that no one ought to act unjustly or to do evil to others, in any case: not even in the case in which they have done injustice or evil to him (*Grote—Plato and the other companions of Socrates*, Vol. I).

THE PHÆDO.

32. (a) Write a clear synopsis of the "Phædo." In what two different aspects can this dialogue be viewed? (*Intro.*, pages 18-22).

(b) What are the arguments urged by Simmias and Cebes against the doctrine of the immortality of the soul? State clearly how Socrates refutes them (*Introduction*, pages 19-20).

33. (a) What have you to say about the reality of the conversation recorded in the "Phædo"? Characterise the philosophical portion of the "Phædo" (*Intro.*, page. 22).

(b) Unfold the successive intellectual changes which the mind of Socrates had passed through (*Introduction*).

34. Describe the death scene of Socrates (*Introduction*,) page 22.

Hints. Socrates shows here an extraordinary degree of self-command, even up to the last moment of his life. About this extraordinary trait of his character, *Alexander Grant* says: "...We might have preferred to see the strong light relieved by shadow, by some touch of nature at the thought of parting from family and friends, by some human misgivings on the threshold of the unknown. But the ancients must be judged by their own standards. The Greek ideal was one of strength, and widely different from the later and deeper Christian ideal of strength that made perfect in weakness. Socrates was the noblest of

Greeks, and in almost all respects his life is worthy to be made an example to all time."—*Xenophon* (*Ancient classics*.)

35. Describe the cosmography of Plato as put into the mouth of Socrates in the "*Phædo*." Or give a description of the earth and the Tartarus as embodied in what is called the myth of the "*Phædo*" (*Introduction*, page 21).

36. Explain fully, with reference to their contexts, the following extracts, unfolding all allusion or references, wherever necessary:—

The Apology.

(1) There is one Socrates who speculates above the heavens.....make the worse the better reason.

(2) In the comedy of Aristophanes.....Socrates swinging.....more or less.

(3) Of course I shall cease from doing wrong.....I have been doing wrong.

(4) He says that the sun is a stone, and the moon earth.

(5) And so young men learn.....buy places in the theatre.

(6) According to you, the demi-gods who died.....the son of Thetis who thought...disgrace.

(7) For when his mother.....to say Hector.....fate awaits the straightway after Hector's death.

(8) I may not remain...beaked ships...earth.

(9) God has sent me...noble horse...gadfly.

(10) Sleep on undisturbed...lives.

(11) A more human impulse...interests.

(12)a certain divine sign from god...indictment.

(13)kind of voice...turns me back...to act.

(14) That was before the destruction of the democracy. When the Oligarchy came...the thirty...Council-chamber.

(15) My friend, I have kinsmen too...I am not born... but of woman.

(16) For were I to be successful,...break you oaths,... no gods.

(17) There is no reward...the Prytaneum.

(18) Such a man only makes a man...really happy.

(19) And now I, who am old and slow...slower pursuer...wickedness.

(20) I am going to die...prophetic power.

(21) They will be harder masters to you than I have been.

(22) Either the dead man wholly ceases to be...another place.

(23) For then it appears that eternity is nothing more than single night.

(24) We should be released...self styled judges...Minos. ...Triptolemus...just in their lives.

(25) Or what would you...Orpheus...Homer?

(26) And for my own part...Palamedes and Ajax... experiences with theirs.

(27) What would you...expedition against Troy or Odysseus, or Sisyphus...could name?

Crito.

(28) Has the ship come from Delos.....die?

(29) O Socrates—"The third day.....Phthia reach."

(30) You are simply playing the game of your enemies

(31) We must think of what.....Truth herself...us.

(32) Ought we to repay wrong with wrong.....may.

(33) Do you think that a State can exist.....private individuals?

(34) You never went away.....Isthmian games..... military service.

(35) All who care for their city.....look askance...law

(36) This is what I seem to hear.....worshippers of
Cybele.....rings loudly.....drowns all other words.

Phædo.

(37) It is worth his while.....spells like these.

(38) For these reasons.....whenever fate calls him.

(39) But if you are careless.....no avail.

(40) Only you must catch me first.....you.

(41) Do you therefore be my sureties.....different way.

(42) You must know that to use words wrongly is not
only a fault.....soul.

THE END.

INVALUABLE BOOKS.

For F. A. Students.

	Rs.	As.	P.
Notes on Wilson's English Essays			
by N. K. Ray B. A.	1	8	0
Do. U. S. Bajpai M. A.	1	8	0
Aids to the Study of Lay of the last Minister			
by Prof. Basu	0	14	0
Notes on Quentin Durward			
by H. P. Agarwala B. A.	1	8	0
Do. by Prof. K. Mukerji and N. G. Chatterji	1	8	0
An Abstract of Medieval			
India by Faruque & Sinha	0	12	0
Notes on Frazer's British India			
by Nath Prasad B. A.	0	12	0
Notes on Inductive Logic			
by A. C. Mukerji	1	8	0
Do. by S. N. Benerji.	0	13	0
Do. Deductive „	0	13	0

Lackhmi Narayan Agarwala

Bookseller & Publisher,

Subzi Mandi, Agra.

